



# The American Academy of Research Historians of Medieval Spain



## Newsletter: Spring 2007

The American Academy of Research Historians of Medieval Spain (AARHMS) was founded in 1974 by a small group of historians who shared a common interest in medieval Iberia. Since 1976 it has been an 'affiliated society' of the American Historical Association, and has continuously sponsored research presentations at the AHA annual meetings, at the International Medieval Congress at Kalamazoo, and in other national and regional settings. For further information see: <http://libro.uca.edu/aarhms/index.html>.

### Officers:

President: Teofilo Ruíz (History, UCLA)  
Secretary Treasurer: Helen Nader (History, U Arizona)  
Newsletter Editor: Brian A. Catlos (History, UC Santa Cruz)  
Review Editor: Simon Doubleday (History, Hofstra U)  
Web-Page Editor: Mark Johnston (Modern Languages, DePaul U)

### Contents:

1. From the Editor
2. President's Message
3. Book Reviews
  - a. Glick, Thomas F. *Islamic and Christian Spain in the Early Middle Ages* Revised edition (Brill: 2005); reviewed by Brian A. Catlos;
  - b. MacKay, Ruth. "Lazy, Improvident People:" *Myth and Reality in the Writing of Spanish History*. (Cornell: 2006); reviewed by David Coleman;
  - c. O'Callaghan, Joseph F. *The Latin Chronicle of the Kings of Castile* (ACMRS: 2002); reviewed by Alberto Ferreiro;
  - d. Romero, Elena, ed., *Judaísmo Hispano: Estudios en memoria de José Luis Lacave Riaño* (CSIC: 2002); reviewed by María Esperanza Alfonso Carro;
  - e. Smith, Damian. *Innocent III and the Crown of Aragon: The Limits of Papal Authority* (Ashgate: 2004); reviewed by Michelle Herder.
4. AARHMS & SSPHS at Kalamazoo
5. Conference and Program Announcements
6. Members' News

### 1. From the Editor

Brian A. Catlos • History, University of California Santa Cruz

Welcome to the spring edition. In his President's message Teo recounts another successful six months of AARHMS activity as well as an exciting up-coming program. We owe Teo our special thanks for his tenure as President – a mantle which he is now preparing to pass on. Likewise, Helen Nader's service as secretary-treasurer has been indispensable to our organization and she deserves our gratitude. Helen, now retired, has also announced her desire to step down and it is up to one of us to take responsibility for keeping track of members and dues. As usual our newsletter contains several book reviews, for which we can thank both review editor Simon Doubleday and our reviewers – please contact Simon if there is a recent book out there you'd like to review. Also, don't be shy – send in any news of your publications, current projects, prizes received, positions accepted and so on for the "Members' News" section. Finally, if you have not done so already, please consider contributing to the Elka Klein Memorial Travel Grant fund – a fitting way to remember our sadly departed colleague and friend.

## 2. President's Message

Teofilo Ruíz • History, University of California Los Angeles

Dear Colleagues and Friends,

I am delighted to announce a series of new initiatives and to report on our activities over the last year. Once again, we all owe a collective vote of thanks to Brian Catlos for his efforts in putting out this electronic newsletter and to the efforts and excellent work on behalf of Helen Nader, Jim Brodman, Simon Doubleday, Mark Johnston, James D'Emilio, and others.

The AARHMS presence at the AHA Annual Meeting

In January 2007, the AARHMS ran three well-attended and very high quality sessions at the Annual AHA meeting in Atlanta, Georgia. We are getting ready to prepare the program for the AHA meeting in Washington, DC in January 2008. Please submit to me proposals for whole panels (preferred) or individual submissions. I will need these proposals no later than 20 April. Send them to me at [tf Ruiz@history.ucla.edu](mailto:tf Ruiz@history.ucla.edu). Co-sponsored with the AHA Research Division (in which I serve), the AARHMS will also offer two additional sessions in Washington, DC (January 2008). These sessions will include four young medieval Spanish scholars. The event will provide us with the opportunity to create links with some of the most promising and prolific medievalist now working in Spain. The program will be sent to you shortly.

The AARHMS at Kalamazoo and at the SSPHS

James D'Emilio has, once again, done a terrific job in organizing sessions at the International Medieval Institute gathering at Kalamazoo this coming May, and we hope to be well represented at the SSPHS meeting in Miami in April.

AARHMS Elections

Helen Nader, who has done an excellent job as a treasurer for our organization, would not like to extend her term of office. I would be most grateful for volunteers to fill the positions of treasurer and my own position of president. Please do nominate yourself or nominate other possible candidates. Send your nominations to me or to Brian Catlos as soon as possible. We must think of an election in the coming weeks and to have a new set of officers in place by the end of the year.

Please also remember to pay your dues. We have tried to keep our expenses to a minimum, but there are always unexpected outlays. We hope, once again, to have a table at the AHA general meeting and that requires hiring a graduate student to man the table for several hours. Dues for the year are \$10.00 (now-a-days the equivalent of one cappuccino and a biscotti). Dues should be made payable to Helen Nader at:

Department of History SSB 215  
University of Arizona  
Tucson AZ 85721- 0027

Cordially,  
Teo Ruiz

### 3. Book Reviews

Editor: Simon Doubleday • History, Hofstra University

- a) Glick, Thomas F., *Islamic and Christian Spain in the Early Middle Ages. The Medieval and Early Modern Iberian World*, 27. Leiden and Boston: Brill, 2005. Revised edition of: *Islamic and Christian Spain in the Early Middle Ages* (Princeton: 1979). ISBN 90-04-14771-3.

*Reviewed by Brian A. Catlos, University of California Santa Cruz*

It has been more than twenty-five years since Thomas Glick published *Islamic and Christian Spain in the Early Middle Ages*, a work which was distinctive not only because it was on the vanguard of the then nascent field of minority studies in medieval history – and indeed of (English-language) medieval Iberian history – but for its original combination of social, technological and intellectual history, for its utilization of sociological and anthropological methodologies and its incorporation of the latest North American and European scholarly currents, and for its originality and breadth. If durability is the hallmark of quality in scholarship then Glick's *Islamic and Christian Spain* is undeniably a classic. It is a seminal work which has scarcely gone unnoted in the bibliography of any subsequent monograph on medieval Spain, and has had a tremendous impact on the work of a whole generation of scholars who have followed (few more so than the present reviewer). In the case of a study so widely known by both students and specialists, after several printings and two Spanish editions, and with so many reviews having been written, there remains scarcely anything for a reviewer of this latest edition to add. The following review, the brevity of which does not reflect the complexity and importance of the work in question, will therefore be restricted to an overview of Glick's study, and some brief observations regarding this particular edition.

The book is intended “as an analysis of central issues and phenomena that contributed to the formation of Islamic and Spanish cultures in the Iberian peninsula and that guided the interaction among both peoples” (p. xii) in the period from the early eighth-century Arabo-Islamic conquest of the peninsula through to the mid-thirteenth century, when the balance of political and cultural power in Iberia had tilted to the side of the Christian principalities. It does not present a narrative, but is a study of the economic, ethnic, social and cultural structures of the Christian and Muslims societies in Spain. It is divided into two parts: “Society and Economy” and “Movement of Ideas and Techniques.”

Part One begins by describing the effects on isolated Visigothic Iberia of its dramatic integration with the dynamic Islamic world-system, and of the process of conversion to Islam which followed close on the heels of the conquest. Iberian geography is dramatically varied and provided an array of environments which could accommodate both native agrarian and husbandry systems and the introduction of highly productive irrigation techniques which new settlers brought – a combination of factors which contributed to the demographic and, consequently, cultural *élan* of al-Andalus. The adoption in Muslim Spain of urban structures which emerged in the Islamic world provided further economic stimulus. The contrast between Christian and Muslim society which is brought out most dramatically relates to social structure: the former being more

class oriented and the latter characterized by agnatic segmentary family groupings. Judicious use is made of Guichard's pioneering work on this subject.<sup>1</sup> Analyzing ethnic relations in al-Andalus, Glick highlights conflict and competition within Muslim society, and refutes the notion that ethnic conflict and cultural diffusion are antithetical in reference to Christian-Muslim relations. A final chapter contrasts social/government structures in the two Spains and takes the position (then a controversial revisionist stance, now the subject of reconsideration and counter-revision) that medieval Christian Spain was "not feudal."

The book's shorter second part begins by surveying the technological impact of the Muslim conquest, in particular the dramatic flow of new products and techniques from the wider Islamic world to Spain. Glick points out that despite the tremendous impact of eastern imports diffusion was bilateral, for example in realms such as armament, where Christians and Muslims developed hybrid systems. For technological diffusion the Christian-Spanish frontier did not represent a barrier. His view of cultural diffusion is similar: it was driven by demographic and economic forces and largely unhindered by ideological concerns. The book concludes with a chapter on "cultural process" – on the ethnogenesis and Spanish culture. Glick is well aware that his subject is heavily burdened by ideological biases of twentieth-century Spain, particularly as they were expressed in the work of medieval Spanish historiography's two rival eminences, Américo Castro and Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz. In this section he offers a needed critique of Castro's notion of "convivencia" as an explanatory concept, and acknowledges Sánchez-Albornoz's concept of "anti-biosis," but fundamentally rejects the reification of cultural categories implicit in the work of each. For Glick, intermediaries, whether Jews, Berbers or trans-Pyrenean Christian principalities, played a crucial role in cultural formation and exchange. The text of the book is complemented by a series of illustrative schematic diagrams and tables.

The impact of this far-reaching, methodologically-diverse and original study can hardly be understated. Although no one refers to a "Glickian school" of Spanish historiography, virtually every subsequent serious English language study of Christian-Muslim interaction has been informed by its perspective and conclusions, some profoundly so. Here, as in later works, Glick did additional service by bringing cutting-edge European research to the attention of English-language scholars through his incorporation of the work of Guichard and the Casa de Velázquez and Miquel Barceló and his disciples. One of the great achievements of this study is that it combines the archeological discoveries of European scholars with documentary research – a tendency which has continued to characterize Glick's work. Moreover, despite nearly thirty having passed since its first publication, this remains a timely study, the continuing relevance of which confirms its watershed status.

The only disappointment of this volume is that the publisher's contention that that text has been "revised... considerably since the first edition" is somewhat misleading. To judge by the citations, the revision seems to have been concluded in the mid-1990s,

<sup>1</sup> P. Guichard, *Structures sociales "orientales" et "occidentales" dans l'Espagne musulmane* (Paris: Mouton, 1977).

although there are occasional references to works as late as 2002. The book is substantially the similar to the 1979 edition. This does not in any way undermine the value or importance of this study, but certain sections, such as those which refer to historiography, would have been improved by taking into account the considerable amount of work which has been done on the subject of Christian-Muslim interaction in recent years (including work by Glick himself). It also means that this well-constructed, durable and expensive edition will be of interest primarily to libraries, which should consider it a mandatory addition to any collection on Medieval History or Islamic Studies. Students and instructors, who may have hoped that this seminal and still-current study would come out in affordable paperback, can instead avail themselves to the less-comfortable but more economical option of consulting the entire 1979 edition in digital format for free thanks to the LIBRO Project (The Library of Iberian Resources Online, <http://libro.uca.edu>), sponsored by the American Academy of Research Historians of Spain.

b) Ruth MacKay, *“Lazy, Improvident People:” Myth and Reality in the Writing of Spanish History*. Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 2006. 298 pp. Paperback ISBN 978-0-8014-7314-2 \$24.95; Cloth, ISBN: 978-0-8014-4462-3 \$65.00.

*Reviewed by David Coleman, Eastern Kentucky University*

Ruth MacKay’s *“Lazy, Improvident People”* is a critical examination of the common notion that Spaniards in general have historically preferred to do anything rather than dishonor themselves through manual labor. This stereotype is, she demonstrates, an old and pervasive one both within Spain and abroad. The Florentine humanist diplomat Francesco Guicciardini as early as 1512 noted what he considered the virtually universal Spanish aversion to work, an evaluation echoed frequently in the eighteenth century by British soldiers and travel writers and French *philosophes*, as well as in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries by European and North American visitors’ accounts and history textbooks. Domestically, too, MacKay demonstrates that Spanish intellectuals for centuries have criticized what they perceive as Spain’s distinct and essentially aristocratic ethos that turns work into a form of dishonor. Beginning in picaresque literature as well as the early seventeenth-century *arbitristas*’ diagnoses of the corrosive ills at the core of Spain’s floundering global empire, such images resonate continuously through the writings of eighteenth-century Spanish Enlightenment reformers and even, she contends, in the works of such prominent twentieth-century historians as José Antonio Maravall and Antonio Domínguez Ortiz.

MacKay organizes her attack on this longstanding and pervasive myth into three sections of the book. In the first section, she analyzes discourses of labor in sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Spain through sources as varied as guild regulations, municipal ordinances, and civil trials. What she finds is a ground-level reality very much at odds with the stereotypical conceptions offered by normative texts. Based in Christian morality and widely shared notions of civic “common good,” the life of labor was, she contends, an integral component of early modern Spain’s social fabric at all levels. The book’s second section moves to a critical analysis of eighteenth-century Spanish Enlightenment characterizations of labor. MacKay highlights the works and ideas of the reformer Pedro Rodríguez Campomanes (1723-1802), whose economic treatises of the 1770s contributed to King Charles III’s 1783 declaration of the “honest and honorable” nature of the craft professions. Long considered by Spaniards and foreigners alike a critical turning point in Spanish attitudes toward work, MacKay downplays the significance of Bourbon-era economic reforms as masking what she sees as an essential continuity in conceptions of work in Spanish society. The third and final section of the book surveys and attacks the widespread legacy of the myth of Spanish *ociosidad* both within Spain and abroad from the Enlightenment era to the twentieth century.

Central to the line of argument maintained by MacKay throughout the book is the disjuncture that she perceives between the qualitative characterizations of Spanish society enshrined in literary texts and political treatises on the one hand, and the much more dynamic reality revealed by archival sources on the other. To MacKay, the myth of the “lazy, improvident” Spaniards amounts to a series of discourses in which intellectuals,

Spanish and foreign alike, have for centuries been responding largely to each other in ways that reflect the specific political contingencies of their own moments rather than the social and economic realities that characterized the lives of the overwhelming majority of ordinary Spaniards.

The greatest challenge faced by MacKay in advancing her argument is the sheer volume of the tradition that she is attacking. To her credit, she does not at all shy away from acknowledging the breadth and depth of evidence against her case. She shows us, to cite a couple of emblematic examples, that in the 1570s, *procuradores* in the *Cortes* of Castile repeatedly petitioned (albeit unsuccessfully) the crown for a requirement of *hidalguía* for all future royal appointments to municipal councils across the realm. In the 1640s, the city of Segovia enacted an ordinance aimed at banning the city's notaries, lawyers, cloth manufacturers and merchants from its municipal council. The stereotype, then, was not entirely without foundation. On balance, however, she contends that attention to such expressions of hostility toward those who earned a living via labor, commerce, or bureaucratic administration must be leavened by the recognition that even much of the Spanish nobility engaged frequently in administrative work and invested in various forms of economic activity. In general, she characterizes early modern Spaniards' discourses on such matters as "incoherent" and inconsistent. At all social levels, expressions of the value and utility of labor and commerce were, she contends if anything more typical, even in the centuries preceding the Enlightenment.

The strength of this rich and thought-provoking monograph lies above all in the synthetic range achieved by the author via her thoughtful engagement with an incredibly broad assortment of sources. In her introduction, MacKay anticipates that some readers might balk at the bold juxtaposition of the various sorts of texts with which she deals, admitting that some might accuse her of "comparing apples and oranges." As she notes in response to such potential criticisms, however, "apples and oranges do, after all, have something in common." On the whole, MacKay is to be applauded heartily for offering us (to build upon her metaphor) a very "fruitful" book indeed—one in which are contained seeds that will likely continue for many years to bear bountiful harvests of discussion and debate.

c) Joseph F. O'Callaghan. *The Latin Chronicle of the Kings of Castile. Medieval and Renaissance Texts and Studies, 236. Tempe, Arizona: Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies, 2002. xlii + 150 p. ISBN: 0-86698-278-7.*

*Reviewed by Alberto Ferreiro, Seattle Pacific University*

Joseph F. O'Callaghan is one of those giants upon whose shoulders we sit, continually enriched by his ongoing scholarly output; the guild of North American Iberianists as it exists today owes an enormous debt of gratitude to the pioneers of the field in his generation. In his opening sentence, O'Callaghan signals the state of Iberian studies in the early stages of his career. "When I first offered a course in the history of medieval Spain to undergraduates at Fordham University more than forty years ago, I discovered that I had neither a textbook nor any collection of translated sources" (p. xvii). He sought to remedy the dearth of material by writing the (seminal) text that, in fact, launched this reviewer ever deeper as an undergraduate student into an exploration of the Visigothic period: *A History of Medieval Spain*. O'Callaghan also began to translate for his students *The Latin Chronicle of the Kings of Castile*, although professional distractions meant that only recently was his translation fully complete. The author expresses the hope "that this translation will encourage students to inquire more deeply into the history of medieval Spain and that those whose attention has generally been focused on northern Europe will discover that events in the Iberian peninsula has a great significance not only in their own right but also for the general history of western Europe" (p. xviii).

The *Latin Chronicle* primarily addresses the period from Alfonso VIII (1158-1214) to Fernando III (1217-1252): "an important period in peninsular history because of the confrontations between Christian Spain and the Almohads" (p. xvii), encompassing Alfonso's victory over the Muslims at Las Navas de Tolosa and the subsequent victories of Fernando III. Of the three main principal sources for the history of Castile and León for the time frame that it covers, the *Latin Chronicle* is in fact the most limited in its chronology, covering the late twelfth and early thirteenth centuries. *The History of the Affairs of Spain* by Archbishop Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada and the *Chronicle of the World* by Lucas, Bishop of Tuy are, as their titles indicate, much broader in scope. However, the chronicle represents "a major source for peninsular development in the late twelfth and early thirteenth centuries, also offers a Castilian perspective on the wider world," (p. xviii), demonstrating that Iberia was hardly isolated, a distant province somehow disconnected from northern European culture.

O'Callaghan's excellent introduction begins by orienting the reader with a succinct overview of peninsular history from the eighth century to the fall of Seville in 1248, providing a valuable historiographical framework for English-language readers, before turning to the question of manuscripts and editions. The *Latin Chronicle* exists in one manuscript [Madrid, Biblioteca de la Real Academia de la Historia, 9/450 (formerly G-1), folios 89 -122], and the codex containing the text dates from the end of the fifteenth century (pp. xxvi-xxvii). The earliest modern edition is that of Georges Cirot (1912); the edition considered most authoritative, that of Luis Charlo Brea (re-edited in 1997). O'Callaghan concurs with Derek Lomax's conclusions regarding the date of composition. Although the work is undated, internal evidence reveals that the author was writing

“during the reigns of Alfonso VIII and Fernando III” (p. xxviii); O’Callaghan further maintains that “the author labored on the Chronicle on a more or less continuing basis” (p. xxx). The reader is then introduced to the scholarly quest to establish the authorship of this anonymous work. Lomax is credited with the definitive identification as Juan, bishop of Osuna and later of Burgos, about whom we know a great deal. O’Callaghan summarizes the salient aspects of his political and ecclesiastical career, his education, his knowledge of external affairs and geography, and how the Latin Chronicle reveals his first-hand knowledge of numerous events described therein.

Finally, O’Callaghan gives an overview of the content of the Latin Chronicle. Chapters 1– 8 cover the period from the death of Fernán González, count of Castile, in 970, to that of Sancho III, king of Castile, in 1158. Chapters 9- 30 describe the major events of the reign of Alfonso VIII; the author of the Latin Chronicle also demonstrates here his knowledge of affairs external to the peninsula; and chapters 31–75 focus on the reign of Fernando III to the fall of Córdoba in 1236, of which – O’Callaghan indicates – the author had direct knowledge (p. xl). The ‘Introduction’ closes with a brief discussion about the translation, based primarily on the editions of Brea and Cirot and secondarily on that of Pecourt; O’Callaghan reveals that it was Cirot who first assigned to the text the title *The Latin Chronicle of the Kings of Castile*, which does not appear in the manuscript (p. xli). Along with maps and copious footnotes identifying people and places mentioned in the text, three genealogies of the kings of Castile-León and Portugal, the counts of Barcelona, and the Almohad caliphs help to unravel the numerous dynasties and families appearing in the Latin Chronicle. The abundant biblical references identified by Brea are usually rendered here from the New American Bible.

The translation of the text itself is highly readable, and taken as a whole the volume will be extremely useful for Iberianists looking for primary sources to integrate into their courses; the publisher would do well to consider offering the volume in a paperback version. The intended audience for this volume – the only available English-language translation to date – is the undergraduate student with little or no reading knowledge of Latin, but it will surely be of great value to graduate students and specialists.

**d) Romero, Elena, ed. *Judaísmo Hispano: Estudios en memoria de José Luis Lacave Riaño*. Madrid: Junta de Castilla y León, Diputación Provincial de Burgos, The Rich Foundation and Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas, 2002. 2 vols. 874 pp. ISBN (Two volume set): 84-00-08079-3.**

*Reviewed by María Esperanza Alfonso Carro, Universidad Complutense, Madrid*

The late José Luis Lacave (1935–2000) distinguished himself as one of the most accomplished, well respected scholars in the field of medieval Spanish Judaism. Following in the footsteps of Francisco Cantera, his mentor, he took special interest in recovering and documenting the material remains of Spanish Jews. Moreover, as a result of his meticulous research and tremendous professional dedication, his work stands as a major contribution to the study of their history. This book is a worthy tribute to his memory.

Apart from two contributions in English, and one in Portuguese, the book is written entirely in Spanish. It appears in two volumes. The first volume includes a foreword by the editor, a long *Vita* in several sections, and twenty two essays on a variety of topics, all united under the rubric Philological Studies. Under the title Historical Studies, the second volume presents thirty-four other contributions. The editorial board has used two selection criteria, calling first for works by friends, colleagues and students of the scholar being honoured, and second for works relating to his main field of research. The unity of subject matter that the second volume exhibits renders it decidedly more coherent than the first, which includes a wide and diverse array of study topics ranging from Masorah and translations of the Bible to medieval Hebrew poetry and Sephardic literature.

Memorial volumes put their reviewers in a particularly difficult position. As the scope of the research presented in many such volumes precludes one from offering any serious critical estimate of their content, most reviews offer little more than a list of contributors and titles. In an attempt not to produce yet another such list, I would limit myself to highlight a limited number of features in this two-volume tribute to José Luis Lacave's memory that make it commendable in my regard. Granted, contributions to projects like the one at hand are inevitably diverse in quality. This observation notwithstanding, many of the essays collected here are worthwhile samples of well-grounded scholarship. The chronological sequence followed in both volumes makes it easy for readers to find topics in the time period of their interest. The chronological arrangement of the essays also helps to eliminate artificial divides, either disciplinary or historical, and lends a sense of continuity to literary or historical phenomena. Worth noting are several articles whose authors edit and translate into Spanish excerpts of literary pieces or archival documents that previously were extant only in a manuscript form. This is the case with contributions by del Valle (81–88), Lazar (121–34), García (163–78), Targarona and Sáenz-Badillos (179–208), Castaño (459–81), Blasco (536–48), Blasco Orellana and Magdalena (575–84), Planas (649–63), and Carrete and Moreno (679–87). Among these, some (see Targarona and Sáenz-Badillos or Castaño) provide exemplary analysis of the edited texts. Many are only offered as tokens of larger editing and translation projects.

Beyond these and many other individual essays that will be of benefit to scholars in the field, the *Vita* that opens the book is highly recommended. Within it, the “Decálogo

cronológico” (17–36), by Iacob M. Hassán, the recent loss of whom is also to be lamented, is definitely worth reading. This twenty-page piece offers not only Hassán’s affectionate account of his colleague’s life and work, but also a variety of details that will be of no less interest than the other scholarly contributions to the book to anyone interested in the history of Hebrew and Jewish Studies in Spain. Projecting the relationship he had with Lacave back in time, and spicing the account up with shared personal anecdotes, Hassán writes about *Sefarad*, the leading Spanish periodical on Jewish Studies, under Lacave’s directorship from 1978 to 1985; about the CSIC, home institution for both Lacave and Hassán for many years; about the links between the CSIC and the University; and about Lacave’s relationship with scholars in Israel and elsewhere. In sum, this “Decálogo cronológico” bears witness to more than a half century of Hebrew and Jewish Studies in Spain.

A final word of praise is due to Elena Romero for a carefully edited text and the successful production of a fine book. The late professor Lacave certainly would have been pleased to see how his work continues in the work of his colleagues and students.

e) **Damian Smith, *Innocent III and the Crown of Aragon: The Limits of Papal Authority* (Aldershot, UK: Ashgate, 2004). 354 pp. ISBN: 0754634922.**

*Reviewed by Michelle Herder, University of Massachusetts at Amherst*

This book covers a limited period of time (1198–1216, the period of Innocent’s pontificate) and a particular geographical region, the Crown of Aragon, yet has far-reaching implications about the relations between royal and papal governments in the central Middle Ages. Smith’s extensive and detailed study of papal and royal letters, charters, and other documents yields an engrossing interpretation of Innocent III’s policies on kingship, heresy, the crusade, and marriage, among other topics. The book also draws attention to a somewhat neglected period of Aragonese history, the reign of Peter II and the aftermath of his death at Muret. This close study of relations between one of the most important medieval popes and one of the Iberian kingdoms has obvious interests for Hispanists (it might profitably be read as counterpoint to Peter Linehan’s study of the Spanish church in the thirteenth century, for example). As a study of Innocent III’s papacy, it also merits attention from a wider audience of medievalists. By focusing on a restricted geographical region, Smith shows clearly the wide range of Innocent’s interests, from royal politics and diplomacy to episcopal discipline to heresy. His portrait of Innocent draws on conventional images of the pope as a reformer, judge, and political operator, while including hesitation and the influence of apocalyptic expectations. Smith’s presentation, sympathetic both to Innocent and to Peter II, deftly shows the complex interrelated interests of the two men.

The first five chapters recount Innocent’s dealings with the crown of Aragon chronologically, from his support and coronation of Peter II (here I follow Smith’s usage of English name and Aragonese numbering for the monarch of Aragon-Catalonia) through the triumph of Las Navas de Tolosa, the disaster of Muret, and Innocent’s guardianship of the minor James I. Chapter 1 provides background on the new pope and the young king and examines their early interactions over several questions, including heresy in Peter’s realms, the property of Peter’s powerful mother Sancha of Castile, and the possibility of a marriage between Peter’s sister and the young Frederick of Sicily. This chapter establishes the book’s general approach, weaving together the intertwined strands of diplomatic, political, religious, and economic goals of both king and pope into a complex but comprehensible picture of thirteenth-century affairs. The second chapter presents a compelling analysis of Peter’s coronation in Rome in 1204, balancing royal and papal political goals, and introduces the topics which dominate the next two chapters: Peter’s rocky relationship with his queen, Marie de Montpellier, and efforts to deal with heresy in southern France. Chapters 3-4 offer an unexpectedly gripping account of the anti-Almohad campaign that culminated in the battle of Las Navas de Tolosa along with the crusade against heresy in the south of France. Here Smith clarifies the simultaneous development of these events, outlining the diplomacy and military preparations affecting both. In particular, the way in which Peter was steadily drawn into a closer relationship with the defending lords of Languedoc becomes clear. Peter’s attempt to divorce Marie de Montpellier, and Marie’s determination to keep her marriage, is presented as a wild card of sorts, affecting Innocent’s attitude toward Peter and Peter’s ability to form alliances. Smith also notes the gap between Innocent’s

rhetoric and the actions of his legates in Occitania, whose independent agenda made it difficult for the pope to apply a consistent and successful policy vis-à-vis the Occitan lords. The fifth chapter deals with the aftermath of Peter's death and the minority of James I. Here, Smith clearly delineates how the actions of Innocent and his new legate, Cardinal Peter Collivaccina of Benevento, were instrumental in stabilizing Aragon's government, through taking custody of James, securing a treaty with the Muslims, rapidly convening a Cort at Lleida, and protecting James's claim to Montpellier.

The last three chapters deal with aspects of Innocent's interaction with the Aragonese church, treating respectively relations with bishops, papal judgments, and promotion of reform. The chronological narrative of the first portion of the book gives way here to a series of case studies of particular problems and disputes. It might have been helpful to draw some clearer reference points for the reader to connect the issues described in these chapters with the larger timeline presented in the earlier section. Issues treated here include papal arbitration of jurisdictional disputes among the Aragonese dioceses (significant problems due the extended claims of territory from the Reconquest) and Innocent's support of new religious groups such as the Trinitarians and the Catholic Poor. Smith sees Innocent's experience with these groups as paving the way for the later, more powerful mendicant orders.

The book concludes with an assessment of Innocent's intervention in the political affairs in the crown of Aragon, judging it to be "conventional and unsurprising (260);" the pope's decisions and their rationales are shown to be with earlier assessments of this pope. In Smith's view, Innocent's interactions with Peter II and other secular rulers were motivated by a desire to "resacralize" the secular king (263), as well as a mission to protect the church. His assessment of Innocent's motives and goals is thoughtful and fair-minded, as is his estimate of the limitations of papal power. The volume also includes editions of 20 documents, most of them previously unpublished charters of Innocent III from Spanish archives. The majority are discussed in the main text, and provide a useful addition to the work.

Though not a groundbreaking re-evaluation of Innocent's pontificate, the book is a solid, thorough, and balanced piece of work. Of particular interest to scholars of Aragon, the thirteenth century, and the papacy, it includes careful consideration of every documented aspect of Innocent's activities in the crown of Aragon, combined with a clear and detailed analysis of the parallel developments of the anti-Almohad campaigns and the Albigensian crusade. The book makes a fine contribution to scholarship of the medieval papacy as well as medieval Iberia.

---

**All reviews are available on-line** on the AARHMS website. Books for review and offers to review books may be sent to the book review editor, Simon Doubleday, at the Department of History, Hofstra University ([Simon.R.Doubleday@hofstra.edu](mailto:Simon.R.Doubleday@hofstra.edu)).

#### 4. AARHMS & SSPHS at Kalamazoo

From: James d'Emilio • Humanities, University of South Florida

##### **42nd International Congress on Medieval Studies, Western Michigan University, Kalamazoo, Michigan (May 10-13, 2007)**

**AARHMS Session no. 1** (Session #22, Thursday, May 10, 10-11:30, Fetzer 1005)

Beyond Powerful: New Approaches to Iberian Monarchy in the Middle Ages I

Organizer: Theresa Earenfight (Seattle University)

Presider: Miriam Shadis (Ohio University)

1. "Architectural Patronage and the Asturian Monarchy: Alfonso II and San Julián de los Prados", Flora Ward (University of Toronto)
2. "Dynastic Propaganda and the Consolidation of States in Twelfth-Century Aragon", Eileen McKiernan González (Berea College)
3. "Constructing Power: the Mudejar Residences of Isabel I of Castile", Danya Crites (University of Iowa)

**AARHMS Session no. 2** (Session #56, Thursday, May 10, 1:30-3:00, Valley III, 302)

Beyond Powerful: New Approaches to Iberian Monarchy in the Middle Ages II

Organizer/Presider: Theresa Earenfight (Seattle University)

1. "Two Queens of León: Teresa of Portugal and Berenguela of Castile", Janna Wasilewski (Harvard University)
2. "Mothers, Virgins, and Queens: Making Monarchy in Early Portugal", Miriam Shadis (Ohio University)

Respondent: Theresa Earenfight

**AARHMS Session no. 3** (Session #108, Thursday, May 10, 3:30-5:00, Valley III, 302)

Reading and Writing Medieval Charters

Organizer: James D'Emilio (University of South Florida, Tampa)

Presider: Jeffrey A. Bowman (Kenyon College)

1. "Forgery and Ideology in Eleventh-Century Palencia", Liam Moore (Columbia U.)
2. "The Jew in the Text: What Christian Charters tell us about Medieval Jewish Society", Jonathan Ray (Georgetown University)
3. "A Monopoly on Writing? Clerical Notaries in the Rural Market Towns of Medieval Catalonia", Gregory Milton (University of South Florida, Tampa)

**SSPHS Session no. 1** (Session #241, Friday, May 11, 10:00-11:30, Bernhard 204)

Mendicants in Spain: Religion and Reform

Organizer/Presider: Jessica A. Boon (Perkins School of Theology)

1. "Poverty and the Passion: Arnau de Vilanova's Spiritual Antidote for the Poisonous Doctrine of Religious Mendicants", Lori Woods (University of Toronto)
2. "'De vita spirituali': St. Vincent Ferrer, Cardinal Cisneros, and Fifteenth-Century Devotional Practices in Spain", Taryn E. L. Chubb (Cornell University)
3. "Sts. Francis and Dominic in Renaissance Spain", Adam G. Beaver (Harvard University)

**SSPHS Session no. 2** (Session #380, Saturday, May 12, 10:00-11:30, Valley III 302)

The Papacy and Medieval Iberia

Organizer: James D'Emilio (University of South Florida, Tampa)

Presider: Jonathan Ray (Georgetown University)

1. "Martin of Braga, De trina mersione, and Petrine Primacy in the Suevic Kingdom of Gallaecia", Alberto Ferreiro (Seattle Pacific University)
2. "The Papacy and Church Reform in Late Twelfth-Century León and Castile" James D'Emilio (University of South Florida, Tampa)
3. "Papal Reform and the Jews in Thirteenth-Century Castile", Maya K. Soifer (Princeton University)

**SSPHS Session no. 3** (Session #462, Saturday, May 12, 1:30-3:00, Fetzer 1055)

Peacemaking, Mediation, and the Idea of Peace in Medieval Iberia

Organizer/Presider: Anne Marie Wolf (University of Portland)

1. "Alfonso X and the Pragmatic Idea of 'Convivencia'", H. Salvador Martínez (New York University)
2. "Strategies of Litigation and Mediation in Thirteenth-Century Tortosa", Thomas Barton (Oberlin College)

Commentator: Simon R. Doubleday (Hofstra University)

**SSPHS Session no. 4** (Session #522, Saturday, May 12, 3:30-5:00, Fetzer 1055)

Women's Religious Life in Medieval Portugal

Organizer: Maria de Lurdes Rosa (Universidade Nova de Lisboa)

Presider: Miriam Shadis (Ohio University)

1. "Current Portuguese Research on Religious Beliefs and Practices of Medieval Women (Portugal, 10th-15th Centuries)", Maria de Lurdes Rosa (Universidade Nova de Lisboa)
2. "Princess 'Saint' Joana (1452-1490): Biography and Hagiography", Gilberto Moiteiro (Universidade Nova de Lisboa)
3. "Beguines and Anchorites in Late Medieval Portugal", João Luis Fontes (Universidade Nova de Lisboa)

**Call for session proposals for Kalamazoo 2008:**

If you would like to organize a session(s) with AARHMS or SSPHS sponsorship for the 43rd International Congress on Medieval Studies (Western Michigan University, Kalamazoo, May 8-11, 2008), please contact James D'Emilio ([demilio@shell.cas.usf.edu](mailto:demilio@shell.cas.usf.edu)) by April 25. He will reply by May 1 to tell you whether your proposal can be included in the AARHMS or SSPHS slate. If not, you may submit it directly to the Medieval Congress by May 15 for consideration as a special session.

I'm happy to discuss preliminary ideas, but I will need the following information by April 25:

1. session title
2. format: set of three/four papers or panel/roundtable
3. one or two paragraph description of the subject/theme, its significance, and potential audience
4. names, affiliations of any potential participants (indicating whether they have expressed interest in participating)
5. your own brief bio and your web address (if you have one)
6. Are you a member of AARHMS and/or SSPHS? Which organization would you like to be sponsored by? For US organizers, membership in the relevant organization will be a condition of sponsorship.

If proposals are accepted by the Medieval Congress, the Call for Papers is issued by early July, and September 15 is the deadline for speakers to submit abstracts. Organizers must have complete sessions ready by September 27, so that the complete slate can be submitted by the October 1 deadline.

## 5. Conference and Program Announcements

From Members

### **New Graduate Program in Geographically-Integrated History & Research Assistantships in Portuguese and Spanish History**

The Department of History of **Idaho State University** will begin its innovative new Master's degree program in geographically-integrated history in August 2007 and is currently accepting applications from interested students. The program is based on the use of Geographic Information Systems (GIS) to integrate information on the basis of geographic location (place) and to facilitate the management, visualization, and analysis of the data.

As its first major research project, the program is participating in a multi-national, multi-disciplinary study of cooperation among merchants and others in the commercial networks of the first global age, 1400-1800. The research focuses on trade networks that linked in some way to the Iberian Peninsula, and the project includes emphases on European and Mediterranean commerce, the Caribbean, former Portuguese Africa, especially Mozambique (and its Atlantic and Indian Ocean links), the Indian Ocean, and SW Pacific Oceania/SE Asia.

Therefore, the department has available graduate research assistantships for work on this project. These research assistants will be students in the Master's degree program, officially called the M.A. in Historical Resources Management, and they will receive a stipend for their research work and full tuition waiver. International students are eligible for both the stipend and tuition waiver. Because funding for this research project became available so late, the department has waived the normal 1 March application deadline. Anyone interested in this graduate program or a research assistantship should contact Jack Owens, Professor of History ([owenjack@isu.edu](mailto:owenjack@isu.edu)).

Admission to the Master's program and qualification for a research assistantship require:

- 1) Good reading knowledge of Portuguese and/or Spanish (acceptable substitutes might be Dutch, French, German, or Italian; good speaking knowledge of Portuguese and/or Spanish will open possibilities for research work in Portugal, Spain, and perhaps other locations);
- 2) An introductory course in Geographic Information Systems (GIS);
- 3) Eighteen (18) upper-division, semester credits in history courses.

Those interested may read an overview of this Master's program in geographically-integrated history in an article published in Vol. 27, No. 3 (Fall 2005, page 46) of the journal *\*ArcNews\**; on online version is available at the URL:

<http://www.esri.com/news/arcnews/fall05/articles/idaho-state-univ.html>

Details about the Master's program and admissions procedure can be found on pages linked to the home page of ISU's history department:

<http://www.isu.edu/history/>



## 6. Members' News

### Submitted by Members

**Dwayne E. Carpenter** (Hispanic Studies, Boston College) announces that he has been appointed Chair of the Department of Romance Languages & Literatures, and Co-Director of the Jewish Studies Program. In his spare (!) time, he works on micro-finance issues in Bolivia in connection with the Boston College Carroll School of Management.

*Congratulations!*

**Theresa Earenfight** (History, Seattle University) announces that her edited volume, *Queenship and Political Power in Medieval and Early Modern Spain* (Ashgate: 2005), has won the award for best Edited Collection from the Society for the Study of Early Modern Women. Essays in the book are by Elizabeth Haluska-Rausch, Joseph F. O'Callaghan, Theresa Earenfight, Nuria Silleras-Fernandez, Mark Meyerson, Marta VanLandingham, Peggy Liss, Eleanor Goodman, Jorge Sebastian Lozano, and Ana Echevarria Arsuaga.

*Congratulations to Theresa and her contributors!*

**Mark D. Johnston** (Modern Languages, DePaul University) announces the publication of "Ciceronian Rhetoric and Ethics: Conduct Literature and 'Speaking Well,'" in *The Rhetoric of Cicero in its Medieval Tradition*, ed. Virginia Cox and John O. Ward (Leiden: Brill, 2006), pp. 143–160 and "The Rethorica nova of Ramon Llull: A Guide to "Speaking Well." *La Corónica* 34.2 (Spring 2006): 135-60.

*Congratulations on a productive year!*

**Salvador Martínez** (Spanish and Portuguese, New York University) announces the publication of *La convivencia en la España del siglo XIII. Perspectivas alfonsíes* (Madrid: Polifemo, 2006), and "Vasallaje castellano-leonés a Cluny: De Fernando I a Alfonso VI" in *Alfonso VI y su época. I: Los precedentes del reinado (966-1065)* E. Fernández González y J. Pérez Gil, León, eds., (León: Universidad, 2006), pp. 147–184.

*Congratulations on a productive year!*

**David Nirenberg** (History, Johns Hopkins University) announces that he has accepted an appointment as Professor in the Committee on Social Thought and in the Department of History at the University of Chicago. David's new email is [nirenberg@uchicago.edu](mailto:nirenberg@uchicago.edu).

*Congratulations!*

**Jack Owens** (History, Idaho State University) wishes to announce a new program being launched Idaho State in the coming academic year (see above, in "Conference and Program Announcements").

*Congratulations on this important and innovative program!*

**Joseph Snow** was honored in May of 2006 on his retirement from Michigan State University. The Ibero American Association of North America (IMANA), a sponsorship organization Snow founded at The International Medieval Conference in 1988, honored him with two sessions, one on Alfonso X and the other on Celestina. Participants hailed from England, Canada, Argentina, Spain, and the USA. Joseph continues his active research program from his new permanent home in Madrid.

Joseph Thomas Snow ([snow@msu.edu](mailto:snow@msu.edu))

c/ Jose Calvo 28, 3-D  
28039 Madrid SPAIN  
Tel (34) 91-311-34-59

*Congratulations on retiring ... and on living in Madrid!*

**Rebecca Winer** (History, Villanova University) has been awarded a Franklin Research Grant from the American Philosophical Society. This will take her back to France and Catalunya to work on her project "Conscripting the Breast: Lactation, Slavery and Salvation in the Realms of Aragon, c.1250–1350."

*Congratulations!*

If your announcement has been **missed**, please (re-)submit it to the Editor for inclusion in the next issue.

This **newsletter** is sent out only in electronic form. The AARHMS e-mail distribution list will not be made public, sold or otherwise used except for the distribution of the semi-annual AARHMS newsletter.

Please send address **corrections** (especially updated e-mail addresses) to Brian A. Catlos, newsletter editor, at [bcatlos@ucsc.edu](mailto:bcatlos@ucsc.edu) (please put AARHMS in the subject line).

© 2006 The American Academy of Research Historians of Medieval Spain  
An affiliated society of the American Historical Association

## DR. ELKA KLEIN MEMORIAL TRAVEL GRANT

Dr. Elka Klein (1965-2005) was passionate about her profession as a historian and a teacher. Her untimely death in the spring of 2005 was a great loss to all who knew her, whether personally or professionally. In her memory, we who were her friends and professional colleagues in the fields of History and Jewish Studies wish to create a fitting memorial to honor her dedication to and her achievements in her academic life. We are thus seeking to establish the Dr. Elka Klein Memorial Travel Grant, which will provide a cash grant to support the work of a doctoral student traveling abroad in order to conduct historical research. Award recipient(s) will be selected by a panel of scholars based on relevance and potential contribution of the proposed work to the fields and concerns important to Elka, such as Sephardic culture, medieval history, and Jewish studies.

The Association for Jewish Studies, of which Elka was a dedicated member throughout her career, has graciously agreed to provide a home for this fund. We now hope that all those who were touched by Elka and her work will contribute to make this grant a reality.

MAY HER MEMORY BE FOR A BLESSING

Name: \_\_\_\_\_ E-mail: \_\_\_\_\_  
 Institution: \_\_\_\_\_ Phone no: \_\_\_\_\_  
 Address: \_\_\_\_\_

\$25 \_\_\_ \$36 \_\_\_ \$50 \_\_\_ \$100 \_\_\_ \$180 \_\_\_ Other \_\_\_\_\_

Please mail donations to:  
 The Association for Jewish Studies  
 Center for Jewish History  
 15 W. 16<sup>th</sup> Street  
 New York, NY 10011-6301

Checks should be made out to The Association for Jewish Studies, with the words "Elka Klein memorial" in the memo line (if you do not put this somewhere on the check, it will not go to the right account!).

For more information, please contact Dr. Gail Labovitz, [glabovitz@uj.edu](mailto:glabovitz@uj.edu)