Newsletter: Spring 2009
Dedicated to Father Ignatius Burns, S.J.

The American Academy of Research Historians of Medieval Spain (AARHMS) was founded in 1974 by a small group of historians who shared a common interest in medieval Iberia. Since 1976 it has been an ‘affiliated society’ of the American Historical Association, and has continuously sponsored research presentations at the AHA annual meetings, at the International Medieval Congress at Kalamazoo, and in other national and regional settings. AARHMS brings together scholars whose research focuses on the lands and peoples of the Iberian peninsula and associated territories from the period spanning roughly 400-1500CE. Membership is open to scholars of all relevant Humanities and Social Science disciplines, including but not limited to History, Literature, Art History, History of Science and Technology, Religious Studies, Jewish Studies, and Islamic Studies. AARHMS is an international organization which welcomes scholars from across the globe, from graduate students through to emeriti. Our mission is to provide a forum for contact, collaboration and scholarly debate. For further information see: www.aarhms.org

Officers
President: Brian Catlos (History, UC Santa Cruz)
Secretary/Treasurer: Mark Johnston (Modern Languages, De Paul U)
Newsletter Editor: Dana Wessell Lightfoot (History, UT-El Paso)
Review Editor: Simon Doubleday (History, Hofstra U)
Council Members: James Broadman (History, University of Central Arkansas); James D’Emilio (Humanities, Univ. of South Florida)

In this Issue

1. From the Editor
2. President’s Message
   a. “Robert Ignatius Burns, historiador y medievalista”, Maria Teresa Ferrer i Mallol
   b. Jill Webster
   c. Rebecca Winer
   d. Teofilo Ruiz
4. Book Reviews

- Carlos López, Speculum. Vida y trabajos del Archivo de la Corona de Aragón (reviewed by Brian Catlos)
- Richard Hitchcock. Mozarabs in Medieval and Early Modern Spain: Identities and Influences (reviewed by Diego Olstein)
- Katrin Kogman-Appel. Illuminated Haggadot From Medieval Spain: Biblical Imagery and the Passover Holiday (reviewed by Brian Catlos)
- Isabel Alfonso, ed. The Rural History of Medieval European Societies (reviewed by Thomas W. Barton)
- Wendy Davies, Acts of Giving: Individual, Community, and Church in Tenth-century Spain (reviewed by Jeffrey Bowman)
- Simon Barton and Peter Linehan, eds. Cross, Crescent and Conversion: Studies on Medieval Spain and Christendom in Memory of Richard Fletcher (reviewed by Lorraine Attreed)
- Ángel Luis Molina Molina. La mujer en la baja edad media: Aproximación a su estudio (reviewed by Ann Craig Belfoy)
- Nuria Silleras-Fernandez. Power, Pity and Patronage in Late Medieval Queenship; María de Luna (reviewed by Elena Woodacre)

5. Calls for Papers and Conference Announcements

6. Members’ Announcements

From the Editor
Dana Wessell Lightfoot, History, Univ. of Texas at El Paso

It is with great honour that we dedicate this issue of the newsletter to Father Robert Ignatius Burns, S.J., founder of AARHMS. As a graduate student at the University of Toronto interested in Valencian history, the first book I read on this medieval kingdom was Burns’ The Crusader Kingdom of Valencia: Reconstruction of a Thirteenth-Century Frontier (1967). Since then, as both a student and professor, Father Burns’ numerous works have had a great impact my own research and teaching. As a researcher, writer and teacher, Father Burns has been enormously influential on scholars across the world. As the memorials included in this issue demonstrate, he has been equally as influential as a friend, colleague and mentor.

The AARHMS newsletter plays an important role in keeping our members in touch with the central issues, scholarship and people in our field. Thus contributions to our newsletter are even more vital, so please forward any announcements for awards, prizes, publications and positions you have received to me at djlightfoot@utep.edu.

Finally, I would like to thank all those who have contributed to the Spring 2009 edition of the newsletter.
From the President
Brian A. Catlos, History, Univ. of California, Santa Cruz

Dear AARHMSistas,

Welcome to the Spring 2009 Edition of our newsletter, the first since we launched our new website last fall. The new site was designed with a view towards facilitating dues payments – you can pay online using your credit card through our secure payment system, or send a check to AARHMS Treasurer Mark Johnston – and keeping our membership roster current and up-to-date. Please take the time to update your details and announce your publications. Annual dues are a very reasonable $15 (tax deductible), part of which goes towards supporting Jim Brodman’s LIBRO project.

The website went up just days after the passing of our founding President, Father Robert I. Burns. It was thanks to his generosity that we were able to develop the website at all; the $2500 web development cost was paid for by funds he donated. We didn’t have the opportunity to thank him for it, but I had the sad honor of attending his funeral and presenting a floral wreath on behalf of AARHMS, a small token of our great esteem for our colleague, mentor and friend.

Congratulations are due to Simon Doubleday on the occasion of the publication of the inaugural issue of the Journal of Medieval Iberian History, of which AARHMS is a proud collaborator. Thanks are due to James D’Emilio who is stepping down after many years of co-ordinating conference sessions for AARHMS (and SSPHS).

I hope you are all enjoying a prosperous 2009 and are looking forward to a productive and enjoyable summer.
In Memoriam: Father Robert Ignatius Burn, S.J.
(1921-2008)

Robert Ignatius Burns, historiador y medievalista: Se especializó en el reinado de Jaime I el Conquistador

MARIA TERESA FERRER I MALLOL (reprinted from El País 28/11/2008)

Los colegas medievalistas de The American Academy of Research Historians of Medieval Spain informaban en un breve email: el padre Robert Ignatius Burns había fallecido la noche del 22 de noviembre. Su salud era muy frágil y por ello, en julio de 2007, le habían trasladado ya desde la Loyola Marymount University de Los Ángeles a la residencia para ancianos de los Padres Jesuitas en Los Gatos, en la misma California.

El padre Burns había nacido en San Francisco, en 1921. Además de los estudios de Teología, ligados a su ingreso en la Compañía de Jesús, realizó dos doctorados en Historia, uno en la Universidad de Friburgo y otro en la Universidad Johns Hopkins, de Baltimore. El primer doctorado versó sobre los indios de América del Norte, tema que no presagiaba en nada su futura dedicación a la Edad Media europea y a la corona catalanoaragonesa.

Hace tiempo, el padre Miquel Batllori, otro jesuita ilustre, contó que le había aconsejado que se dedicase a estudiar la historia medieval catalana y le había hablado de la riqueza de la documentación conservada. Así pues, su segundo doctorado versó sobre el rey Jaime I el Conquistador y la Iglesia valenciana, para analizar cómo se organizaba ésta en un territorio acabado de ganar al islam por el monarca. La obra se publicó en 1967: The Crusader Kingdom of Valencia: Reconstruction on a Thirteenth-Century Frontier, traducida en 1982 al castellano (El reino de Valencia en el siglo XIII, iglesia y sociedad) y al catalán en 1993 (El regne croat de València, por la editorial Tres i Quatre).
Desde que emprendió este estudio, su presencia se hizo habitual en la sala de investigadores del Archivo de la Corona de Aragón de Barcelona. Era un hombre alto, rubio, si bien el pelo le blanqueaba ya, de ojos azules y la tez blanca y sonrosada. Era una persona más bien tímida, pero de trato muy agradable y extremadamente cortés y bondadoso. Hablaba castellano, aunque bastante peculiar; por ejemplo, para él, el paso de peatones fue siempre "el paso de pedestres". Naturalmente, comprendía el catalán, pero no lo habló nunca.

Siempre en el archivo

Era muy metódico y no solía cambiar sus costumbres para adaptarse al país. Así, para aprovechar más el tiempo, solía hacer sólo una comida fuerte al día, hacia las seis de la tarde, que era cuando cerraba el archivo, en un restaurante de cocina continua. Era un buen conversador y no le faltaba el sentido de la ironía.

Desde esa primera obra se especializó por completo en el reinado de Jaime I el Conquistador y en la conquista del reino, su organización posterior y, en especial, en la situación de la población islámica que continuó en el reino bajo dominio cristiano. Entre su bibliografía destacan _L'Islam sotto els Croats, Colonialisme medieval: Explotació postcroada de la València Islàmica y Jaume I els valencians del segle XIII_. Con el fin de integrar a los estudiosos norteamericanos especializados en la corona de Aragón y en la de Castilla, coordinó la obra _Los mundos de Alfonso el Sabio y Jaime I el Conquistador, razón y fuerza en la Edad Media_. Su labor ha merecido numerosos honores y premios.

En los últimos meses, a pesar de que se encontraba débil y que veía poco, trabajaba aún un par de horas diarias para terminar el cuarto y último volumen de su _Diplomatarium of the Crusader Kingdom of Valencia. The registered charters of its conqueror Jaume I (1257-1276)_. Le preocupaba que la muerte le sobreviniera antes de terminar su obra magna y seguramente ese deseo le ayudó a sobrevivir. Pudo completarla, pero ha fallecido mientras corría las pruebas.

**AN APPRECIATION OF THE LIFE OF FATHER ROBERT I. BURNS, S.J. from Jill Webster**

I was greatly saddened by the death, not entirely unexpected, of Father Burns last November who, when I last talked to him before leaving for Barcelona in the Fall of 2008, still had plans to finish projects which he had started years before, such as his proposed work on the Friars of the Sack.

My personal and professional memories of him are so many and so diverse that it is difficult to select a few from the time we spent together on a variety of occasions, in different archives in Spain followed by enjoyable meals in nearby restaurants and often book-hunting. One of Father Burns’ favourite pastimes in Barcelona was to wander round the bookstores and street markets and his remarkable eye for anything of importance led to the extraordinary library he built up near Los Angeles. Although I always disagreed with his taking manuscripts

AARHMS Spring 2009 | 5
out of Spain, something that today would be impossible, at least until just before his death they were accessible to any who wished to consult them.

By many, he will be remembered for his unfailing dedication to his work, his generosity, his sense of humour and his willingness to help anyone who had difficulty reading documents in a seemingly illegible script but which he nearly always managed to decipher, or had personal problems which they brought to him. He never turned anyone away.

Words are inadequate to describe the loss to the profession of an outstanding scholar and teacher and a remarkable human being who never lost his love of simple things but who also enjoyed some of the more sophisticated aspects of modern life. His lasting memorial will not only be the books he published but those he collected, together with his participation in associations, congresses and other professional gatherings. For many, his legacy will be the support and encouragement he gave them to embark on, or to succeed in their professional life.

Jill R. Webster  
St. Michael’s College, University of Toronto  
March, 2009.

From Rebecca Winer, Villanova University

I am very fortunate that Father Robert Ignatius Burns, S.J. was my teacher, thesis adviser, mentor and friend. I first met him in January 1991 when I enrolled in his seminar on medieval Mediterranean Spain. As a MA/PhD student beginning my second semester at UCLA I remember thinking that Father Burns cut the most imposing professorial figure I could imagine at over 6 feet tall and always dressed in priestly black. I soon came to appreciate that Father Burns was the most approachable and generous teacher I would ever study with, his dignity belied his kind, peaceable and gentlemanly manner.

The medieval Mediterranean world he lectured and wrote about was a revelation to me. I began at UCLA intending to specialize in English history, but within weeks of entering his classroom I had decided to change my research focus to the Christian, Jewish and Muslim women and children of the medieval Mediterranean. My story of moving south was typical of many of Father Burns’ students. Our attraction to his teaching was not surprising since he happily took on the supervision of so many different types of projects. His own publications displayed a versatility shared by few: medieval Iberia, Church history, social history, Jewish Studies, popular piety, legal history, intellectual history, institutional history, commerce and economics, conversion and Islam, crusade—his breadth within the area of the Catalan-speaking regions was virtually all-encompassing. But students, undergraduate and graduate, were not simply drawn to him because of his great erudition: this giant in our field actually talked to them.

Until 2007 if you wanted to find Father Burns he was readily available every day, except the Lord’s, in his Institute of Medieval Mediterranean Spain in Marina del Rey. This is where he reported to work in the morning, when he was not at UCLA, and yet he took time to welcome
and orient any visitors who came no matter what deadlines of his own loomed. Father Burns founded the Institute of Medieval Mediterranean Spain as a space where his students, and any others who wanted and needed, could have free access to the comprehensive collection of scholarly monographs and articles, rare books, photocopies and microfilms of parchments, royal and notarial registers that he had carefully assembled over many, many years. Father Burns even started a fund for travel grants so that graduate students from all over the country could use the collection. His maintaining of the Institute in and of itself was one of the most generous actions of a cutting-edge researcher I have ever known.

Father Burns thrived on expanding the field of the history of the medieval Realms of Aragon, a field he essentially founded for an Anglophone audience, in countless other ways. I remember him as constantly and eagerly reading drafts of book manuscripts and articles for many colleagues. The spectacular volume and quality of his publications brought him honor after honor as a researcher, arguably he should be listed among the top medieval historians working during the second half of the twentieth century, but Father Burns gave so much more to the field. Simply put he was a rare scholar-teacher who enriched the lives of most who knew him. He is and will be sorely missed.

**Father Burns, from Teofilo Ruíz, UCLA**

I am deeply honored to contribute a brief tribute to this issue of our Newsletter in honor of Father Robert Ignatius Burns, S.J., who we had the misfortune to lose recently. In these pages, others, who are more qualified than I am to do so, will offer thorough testimonies of Father Burns’ numerous and unique contributions to the study of medieval Iberia and to providing us with a new understanding of the relations of Christian, Jews, and Muslims in the peninsula. In a forthcoming book that collects Father Burns’ most significant articles, Paul H. Freedman already provides an insightful look at his work and place in Iberian medieval scholarship and historiography. Rather than review his extensive opus or his scholarly contributions, I would like to turn my remarks into a personal reflection on the man and on his generous support for all of those working in this field.

I first met Father Burns in the very early 1970s. He was spending a year at the Institute for Advanced Study at Princeton, and I was ready to take my first research trip to Spain and to begin working on my dissertation. Without my asking for it, he kindly, very kindly indeed, offered to help, wrote me a letter of introduction to different archives in Spain, and, in his unique gentle and cordial manner, provided me with most helpful advice. I have never forgotten his generosity, nor his selfless act of helping a young scholar at the very beginning of his career. All those who knew him or who had the privilege of working with him have long known that such was his unfailing behavior throughout his life: to help others, to encourage others, to facilitate the work of those around him.
Having had the fortune to meet him often at conferences, seminars, and other scholarly events, I was always impressed by his civility, his wish to be of help, his natural effacing of his own extraordinary accomplishments. As one of the co-founders of the American Academy of Research Historians of Medieval Spain, he toiled ceaselessly to foster the study of the peninsula, creating around him a community of scholars, linked by an unusual respect and community of good feelings.

Around eleven years ago, I had the great fortune and honor to succeed him as a faculty member at UCLA. Together with Paul Padilla and Paul Chevedden, two among his many loyal students, and sometimes Betsy Perry we went to lunch with Father Burns from time to time. We usually met him at his Mediterranean Institute, a place open to all, where he welcomed everyone to his wonderful and most valuable collection of books, facsimiles, and documents, the very sources for the study of medieval Iberia in general and the medieval kingdom of Valencia in particular. These memorable lunches will remain engraved in my mind for as long as I live. It was not that used the opportunity to discuss seminal issues in the history of medieval Spain or burning scholarly issues. What made these lunches so wonderful was Father Burns’ gentle and cordial presence. We all know he was a great and prolific scholar, but I wish to remember him and for all of you to remember him as well most of all, as a kind and gentle soul. He was, first and foremost, a nice man, a very nice man. He was someone who lived his faith and did so in an exemplary and humane fashion. We will miss him always.

**Book Reviews**

Editor: Simon Doubleday, Hofstra University


Historians, though they may pass the most important, enjoyable and productive moments of their careers in archives, do not necessarily think very much about the history of the archives themselves, or of the people and processes responsible for preserving and shaping them. Those of us who work at the Archive of the Crown of Aragon in Barcelona will know Carlos López as the personally affable and professionally exacting archivist who has served as Director since 1998. In *Speculum*, Dr. López presents us with what is at once an intimate meditation on the nature of the office of archivist and an unconventional account of one of Europe’s most important and least appreciated medieval archives, tracing the history of the archive through the rulers, archivists and historians who have conserved and shaped it.

The Archive of the Crown of Aragon is, of course, one of the largest and richest medieval archives of Europe, with a collection of documentation, of incredible variety and quantity, stretching back to the ninth century. It was formally constituted almost seven hundred years ago under the initiative of the Catalano-Aragonese king Jaume II. Unlike so many other European archives, it has survived the accidents of time and circumstance, preserving entire
series of royal correspondence, fiscal and administrative records, and court cases, and as such has provided a virtually limitless source of data for historians and literary scholars of a range of specializations and sub-disciplines.

The book is essentially a single essay, which begins with Dr. López’s account of leaving his former post as Director of the Archive-General of the Kingdom of Valencia, and taking up his position in Barcelona, as successor to the much-esteemed Dr. Rafael Conde. Reflecting on the nature of his calling, the tremendous responsibility which it entails, and the limits to which an archivist can impose his own vision on the institution which he oversees, he evokes a series of literary figures, ranging from Saramago and Nabokov to Saint Augustine, before moving into the history of the archive itself.

Catalan rulers had long been aware of the importance of maintaining and safeguarding their records. In the twelfth century, Ramon Berenguer IV had compiled the *Liber feudorum maior* in order to cement his hegemony over his rival Catalan barons, and in the mid-thirteenth century, Jaume I had began to systematically record his out-going correspondence in registers. It was, therefore, consistent that the latter’s grandson, Jaume II should establish a physical space to organize and safeguard his documentary patrimony. Thus, in 1318 Pere de Boil, the royal treasurer (*mestre racional*), became the first in a line of archivists which the author is the latest to serve. Two centuries later, one of de Boil’s successors, Pere Benet, would sum up the task of managing the archives in the following terms, “This archive is unlike any others; in those it is enough to have good handwriting, here one must have the instinct of a ferret or a bloodhound, the shrewdness of a hunter” (p. 32).

A series of engaging anecdotes run through the book. We learn, for example, of the documentation which Joan II confiscated from the “usurpers” who challenged him, and which instead of destroying, as was customary, he ordered to be conserved, but bound in black and marked with the Greek theta (for death) to denote their false origin. Joan appointed Antoni Carbonell as archivist, who locked himself up in the reading rooms, to cure his temptation of women and to compile a comprehensive inventory of the collections. This task was later reprimed by Josep Llaris, a royal notary who took over the position in 1672. Barcelona was no longer the center of an independent Mediterranean empire, but the composite nature of the Hapsburg dominions preserved the autonomy of the archive and guaranteed its survival.

From the time of Carbonell, the task of archivist had dovetailed into that of historian and chronicler; so it would continue – a trend which reached its apogee in the figure of Próspero de Bofarull y Mascaro. A former lawyer, de Bofarull took possession of the archive in 1814, having lived through the tumultuous early years of nineteenth-century Spain, and with a keen sense of the significance of history and of the fragility and vulnerability of the written record. Hence, when on a visit to the archives in 1827, King Fernando VII prepared to light up a cigar, de Bofarull pointed reminded him that smoking was expressly prohibited on the premises. But the archivist had already saved the collection from a threat as great as that of a stray spark; in 1820 a pamphlet he wrote spearheaded the resistance to the governmental decree that had ordered the transport of the archive’s contents to a new facility at Madrid. Nevertheless, de Bofarull is
better remembered by historians for the *Collección de documentos inéditos*, the series which he founded and which has been a fundamental resource for historians of the Crown of Aragon ever since.

Surviving the tumults of the nineteenth century, as Spain inched towards Civil War the archive was under the supervision of the eminent historian Martín de Riquer, who consolidated and expanded it by gathering into its collection the medieval archives of the Bailía General and the Mestre Racional, which had previously been managed separately. The collection survived the turmoil of the war, thanks to the efforts of Ernesto Martínez Ferrando, who oversaw the evacuation of the most important parts of the collection from Barcelona to the isolated village of Viladrau. Mercifully, since the Civil War, the greatest upheaval the archive has faced has been its removal from the evocative but cramped quarters of the medieval Palau del Llochinent in Barcelona’s old city to its present location, a less beautiful but eminently more functional installation in Almogavuer street not far to the north of the old location.

*Speculum* is required reading for anyone doing research in the Archive of the Crown of Aragón. Personal and engaging, it is a memoir peppered with obscure but illuminating anecdotes which breathe life into an institution that many of us encounter as a rich but fundamentally impersonal collection of documentation. In this work Carlos López has resuscitated the memories and legacies of seven hundred years of archivists, to whom we all owe a tremendous debt.

Brian A. Catlos
University of California Santa Cruz


Ten years ago, the Mozarabs were still considered a forgotten minority. In the last decade, however, many studies have been devoted to the Christians in al-Andalus, as well as to their existence among the Christians from northern Iberia, either as immigrants or as conquered peoples. The book under review offers a synthesis based on three major pillars. The first is the

---


AARHMS Spring 2009| 10
concern with terminological questions raised by the mere concept of the Mozarab. The second pillar is a chronological axis that articulates a narrative of the political history of Medieval Iberia in which the history of the Mozarabs is embedded. Finally, the third pillar is the revisionist perspective through which the history of the Mozarabs and ultimately terminological questions are approached.

The terminological questions are treated on three different levels: historical, historiographical, and analytic. On the historical level, Hitchcock reminds us that Christians in al Andalus were referred to in contemporary Arabic sources as 'ajam (foreign), dhimmī (under protection), mushrikūn (politeist), nasrānī (Christian), rūm (Roman), afranī (Frank), or musālima (pacified). The tension resulting from these findings and the Arabic derivation of the term musta'rib led Hitchcock to consider the attribution of this term to Christian authorship, either among the Christians in al Andalus (as suggested by Cantarino) or those from northern Iberia (as argued by Chalmeta). Then, from the first half of the eleventh century – when the term muzarave appears for the first time in a Latin document from León – and the twelfth century – when the Castilians mention muzaraves and christianos muzaraves in their Romance documents –, Hitchcock jumps to the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries to track the disputes about the term Mozarab amidst the concerns raised by the concept of "blood purity." On the historiographical level, Hitchcock refers to the changing meanings of the term Mozarabs and the different dimensions of its application by different authors. Among the meanings he includes are Spanish Christians, Christians under Muslim rule, Arabized Christians, and siblings of pre-Islamic Christians. Among the multiple dimensions to which the term Mozarab was applied, he mentions culture, art, architecture, dialect, liturgy, and songs (kharjas). Out of this multiplicity of meanings and usages, Hitchcock undertakes the analytic task of defining what Mozarab means. In his mind, "'Mozarabism' covers so many diverse areas, both temporal and territorial that it is legitimate, I think, to call it a phenomenon. As such, its chameleon-like properties can be most effectively appreciated". (p. XI)

In light of the variety implied by the term Mozarab across time and space, Hitchcock articulates a narrative structured on a political chronological axis that runs from 711 to 1296. Al Andalus during the eighth and ninth centuries is presented as a society overwhelmingly composed by Romance-speaking Muslims and Arab-speaking Christians, such as Iohannes the bishop of Córdoba, Recemundo/Rabi' Ibn Zayd al-usquf al-Qurṭūbī, and Ishāq b. Balashq al- Qurṭūbī. Consistent with his argument that there is no evidence of intolerance, he sustains that "the martyrdom episode... constitutes an exception in the history of the relations between the Muslim rulers and the indigenous population" (p. 30). Moreover, without religious persecution no Christian migration from al Andalus toward the north should be expected. Therefore, the Arabic anthroponomy on Latin documents proceeding from León during the ninth and tenth centuries could be attributed to local Muslims (Arabs or Berbers), former Muslims now Christianized, or immigrants from al Andalus, either Christians or Muslims. Only in Toledo after the Castilian conquest (1085) can the presence of Mozarabs be corroborated by the explicit use of the term Mozarab in the sources to refer to the local Christian population. But even here the
supposed Mozarabs arrived from al Andalus could be in fact Muslims "lukewarm in their adherence to whatever creed" (p.91) in an analogous situation to those already mentioned in León. Finally, neither the mu'ahidun who guided Alfonso I from Aragón in his incursion though al Andalus (1125-1126) nor the rūm al-baladiyyūn whom he met there could be assumed to be Mozarabs. Accordingly, in Hitchcock’s view, it is only when an explicit mention of christianos mozarabis was made that the existence of Mozarabs can be demonstrated. These properly demonstrated Mozarabs who conspired with the Aragonese king against their rulers, the Almoravids, brought the typical tolerance of al Andalus to its end and with it to the existence of the Mozarabs there as well.

Hitchcock's consistent reluctance to recognize the presence of Mozarabs in León, Toledo, and al Andalus throughout his narrative is due to the adoption of the milder version of the revisionist approach (an extremer version of it marginalize their existence altogether)2. This approach holds that the existence of Mozarabs must be demonstrated by explicit mention of them in the sources and not just by assuming their presence.3 No doubt, this methodological scruple in identifying a particular population as Mozarab is the major contribution of the revisionist approach. Nevertheless, the rigor that this approach demands in the identification of a population as Mozarab must also be applied for any alternative identification, such as that of former Muslims who converted to Christianity. Therefore, the Arab anthroponyms in León cannot be easily attributed to Muslims or Christians who were formerly Muslim, because there is no specific reference to them either. Instead, in the case of Toledo, since a few examples of Christians who were formerly Muslim are clearly referred to in the sources as mutanṣir it is easier to conclude that the vast bulk of anthroponyms belongs to Mozarabs by considering the peculiarity of the names repertoire and the evidence from the chronicles, privileges, and transactions.4 In the end, the lack of an explicit identification of a population mentioned in the sources should strengthen the research efforts instead of simply discarding its possible Mozarab identity.

In short, in the terminological discussion and the definition of the term Mozarab, this book opens the broad scope that it and Mozarab studies deserve. However, the historical narrative, by limiting itself to the political realm and disregarding culture, art, architecture, dialect, liturgy, literature, society, economy, law, and theology, substantially narrows the horizon. Moreover, the adoption of the revisionist perspective narrows the book further to the point that if consistently applied it should lead to the elimination of at least chapters 3 and 4 (because "it is impractical at the very least to expect one word to do service for two contradictory interpretations... Christians who resisted Islam, and ... Arabization in the Christian kingdom of León," p.128), as well as chapters 5-6 and parts of chapters 7 and 8, because as most of the

---


people involved in them cannot be identified as Mozarabs they should be identified as Muslims in the past or present. Paradoxically, in these internal contradictions, perhaps, Hitchcock will contribute to the stimulation of the debate on the Mozarabs, as was his original goal.

Diego Olstein, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem


*Illuminated Haggadot from Medieval Spain* is a book of far wider scope than its title would lead one to believe. Although at its core it examines the phenomenon of medieval Jewish figurative painting through the medium of seven illuminated prayer books produced within the Crown of Aragon and its cultural orbit (including southwest France) in the early fourteenth century, it is also an ambitious attempt to reconsider the nature of the discipline of art history, and the history of the Jews in Spain and of Christian-Jewish relations in the Middle Ages. Beginning with a discussion of the hypothetical links between Byzantine Christian and contemporary Jewish art, Kogman-Appel proposes that Jewish narrative painting re-emerged alongside Christian narrative art in the thirteenth century (p. 2). Not only are their commonalities shared by the style of Jewish and Christian picture cycles, but the similar structures of Haggadot and Latin psalters further suggests influence (p. 3).

The manuscripts in question are “The Golden Haggadah,” the so-called “Sister Haggadah” (BL, Ms Or. 2884), the “Sarajevo Haggadah” (named for its most recent provenance, rather than its point of origin), the “Prato Haggadah,” the “Rylands Haggadah,” the “Brother Haggadah” (BL, Ms Or. 1404), and the “Bologna-Modena Mahzor.” The *Haggadot* are guides for following the ritual associated with the Passover; the Mahzor is a prayerbook, which contains additional material.

The first part of the book discusses the manuscripts themselves, both in reference to their internal elements and to each other. The Golden Haggadah is examined in the context of the Neapolitan and Capetian motif books which its two expert miniaturists each used for inspiration, while Or. 2884 is revealed as a work which, while inspired by the Golden Haggadah, features illuminations of poorer artistic quality but which were adjusted to better reflect Jewish traditions. BL, Ms Or. 1404 also shows the strong and direct influence of Italian Christian devotional books, and itself served as a model for the Rylands Haggadah. Finally, the Sarajevo Haggadah and the Bologna Mahzor represent a more synthetic product. Christian influences are clear, but the illumination drew on and mixed various models. Together the six books clearly reflected conventions current among Jewish illuminators of the fourteenth-century. Christian motifs were put through a Jewish filter and specifically non-Jewish themes (e.g. those relating to Christ) were not reproduced. Kogman-Appel sees in the predominance of Italian rather than French influences as a reflection of the general state of *convivencia* among Christians and Jews in the corresponding kingdoms.
The second part of the book addresses two over-arching themes relating to the function of the images in this books, and to their makers. Chapter 6, “Jewish Biblical Exegesis Employed in the Strategy of Image Making” examines the expression of Midrashic motifs in these works, concluding that they can be linked explicitly to exegetical positions which were native to or current among late medieval Spanish Jews. When it came to appropriating Christian styles, Jewish artists were sensitive to omit or redesign pictorial representations of Old Testament scenes in which Christian artists foreshadowed the Crucifixion. Hence, for example, the scenes of Moses birth, which typically opened Exodus cycles in Christian books, and which connoted the later birth of Christ, were simply omitted by Jewish artists. They also repositioned the arms of the figure of the patriarch Jacob, which Christian artists arranged to evoke the Cross.

The final chapter, “Designing the Messages of the Sephardic Picture Cycles,” emphasizes the variety within Jewish artistic tradition, both in terms of regional variations during the late Middle Ages, and by challenging the notion of continuity of style from the Antique era to this period. These Haggadot are shown to reflect a specific moment in the development of Jewish culture, a time marked by tensions between rationalists and anti-rationalists, a growing anxiety at Jews’ position in Christian society, and contact between Mediterranean Jews and their Ashkenazic cousins. These tensions were catalysts for the midrashic revival which was sustained by the patronage of the wealthy Jewish scholar-courtier class of the Spanish kingdoms, and of which these devotional books are one aspect.

Throughout Illuminated Haggadot, Kogman-Appel moves effortlessly through time and space comparing the production of these books to contemporary Christian and Jewish works elsewhere in Europe, contextualizing them in terms of social, and cultural developments across the Christian and Islamic world, and relating this process to earlier trends of artistic diffusion and acculturation. Points of comparison as diverse as northern French Bibles, Neopolitan and Sicilian church art and the frescos of Doura Europos are not only alluded to, but woven into the author’s arguments. She engages with, assesses, and critiques various traditions and perspectives of the historiography of art and material culture.

In sum, the book represents an impressive combination of tight technical analysis and theoretical inference. The Haggadot are examined in terms of their visual content, structure, uses, production, and the social and cultural contexts in which they were produced. It is a study which is at once highly technical and detailed, and analytically far-reaching and original. It teaches us much not only of the history of Spain, but of Jewish history, the history of art in Europe and the Islamic world, the role and importance of illustrative religious art, the nature of cultural relations between different ethno-religious groups. Moreover, it is written in a style that is evocative and accessible to non-specialists without sacrificing precision. While, unfortunately, the book does not have a separate bibliography, it does include a lavish appendix, almost one hundred and fifty pages in length, featuring color and monochrome illuminations taken from the Haggadot and various of the Christian works to which they are compared.
In 2009, *Illuminated Haggadot*, was very deservedly honored with the American Historical Association’s “Premio del Rey,” a prize for books on the pre-1516 history of Spain endowed by AARHMS founding President, the much-missed Father Robert Ignatius Burns.

Brian A. Catlos
University of California Santa Cruz


Over the past half century, rural history has been one of the more dynamic and historiographically complex sectors of medieval studies. In trying to reconstruct what has happened, one has to balance regional or national traditions that have developed relatively independently with the influence of pervasive models such as *incastellamento* and feudalism. Until recently, the graduate student or scholar interested in comparing rural historiographies would have had little choice but to skim through a considerable stack of monographs or region-specific surveys. The deficiency of sweeping comparative analyses has elicited calls to arms by important figures in the field, such as Wickham. While state-of-the-field conferences and review essays concerning one or perhaps two regions have surfaced periodically, precious few collections comparing national subfields within European history of the countryside have been produced in recent years.

What Isabel Alfonso has accomplished in editing this collection of essays, first published in a modified form in the Spanish-language journal *Historia Agraria*, goes a long way toward filling this gap. In it, she includes exceedingly up-to-date reflections by the some of the most eminent and active scholars in the agrarian history of each selected region: Britain (Dyer and Schofield), France (Cursente), Spain (García de Cortázar and Martínez Sopena), Italy (Provero), Poland (Górecki), plus a more wide-ranging category on German-language historiography (Demade). Alfonso provides clear explanations and justifications for form and style of the volume in her introductory essay, providing a window onto the thought and planning that went into the creation of the collection. She confesses that the volume was not intended to be exhaustive in either the treatment of each national subfield or in its geographical coverage. Selections were made based on the editor’s sense of the “significance of their historiographies” and “on the grounds of research affinities with the individual contributors”. Since the contributors were only given very general directives and called to focus on their own area, the selections are not always congruent or very comparative in their analysis. Alfonso’s introductory essay helps compensate by observing and analyzing connections, shared problems, and overt differences between the surveyed regions and treating questions concerning methodology and training within the broader field of agrarian history.

However, I ultimately see these characteristics as an asset and think the editor was correct in setting up the volume in this way. Most importantly, it promotes independent comparative thinking on the part of the reader and does not overly distract the contributors from their main objective or taint their discussions with forced allusions. Indeed, the manner in which the
volume was compiled is ideal since it freed up each contribution to pursue its own agenda given the peculiarities of the rural history of the respective region rather than being forced to adhere to any rigid rubric. This permits each essay to hit the ground running, adapting its discussion both to other work that has sized up the field, either summarizing those findings or picking up where that earlier work left off, and to the objectives viewed as most pressing to the author at hand. Accordingly, both the “temporal dimension[s]” (as Alfonso puts it) and the topics of discussion of the selections are customized. For example, in their survey on British agrarian history, Dyer and Schofield note that no general survey had been written since 1990 and so focus their attention on the past fifteen years, noting the decline of manorial and estate studies of late and the rise of interest in tenant relations. Cursente, on the other hand, extends his analysis back to 1975 in order to assess crucial broader trends in rural history specific to France. Dyer and Schofield conduct their survey and analysis according to topic (“Lords, Peasants and Agriculture, Up to 1000”, “Agricultural Technology”, “Peasants and Commercialization”), while Cursente rightly prioritizes methodological concerns (“Decline in General Interest for Rural History and the Transformation of the Geographical Distribution of Research Centres” and “Training Students How to Look at the Study of Habitat”) alongside the major movements and debates that have rocked the French academy, in particular incastellamento and the feudal mutation. Provero surveys forty years of Italian agrarian history and spends much of his time recounting the impact of Toubert’s incastellamento and the new directions undertaken more recently by pioneers like Wickham. In the most extensive and complicated essay in the collection, Demade extends his perceptive analysis of German-language historiography of the countryside to the 1930s, addressing, most interestingly, the retreat of German-language historical works from center-stage since the Second World War. Górecki’s succinct presentation of the historiography of Poland’s peasantry sets the stage by reviewing Szczur’s recent synthesis of Polish medieval history in general and then works backward, highlighting the importance of ducal/royal power, cultural history, interethnic relations, and other influential topics on this historiography.

It is hard to exaggerate the wealth of information and learning contained in this excellent collection. Taken as a whole, the review essays are clear and upfront, broken up into clear subheadings that facilitate both casual reading and the hunting down of specific interests. One can get the lay of the land for a given field in a few short minutes or delve into the specifics of the essays and the mountains of references to the most recent monographs, unpublished dissertations, and ongoing research projects cited in the footnotes as well as conveniently in the bibliographies for each essay.

Readers, especially those who find themselves frustrated by what is missing from this volume, should keep in mind that Alfonso’s collection of essays, as the inaugural volume of Brepols’ new series (in collaboration with Yale University) on “The Medieval Countryside” edited by Paul Freedman and a diverse collection of eminent international scholars of agrarian medieval history, represents only the beginning of an ongoing conversation about and analysis of the course of research, methodologies, and models. We can only hope that the economic downturn will not encourage Brepols to silence this stimulating, long-awaited, and very important forum.

Thomas W. Barton, University of San Diego

*Acts of Giving* is a fascinating exploration of life in tenth-century northern Spain. Wendy Davies brings the rigor and imagination that characterize her earlier work on Brittany and Wales to new territory. Her engagement with Spain’s rich charter evidence yields an insightful account of property and community.

In Chapter 1, Davies describes the broad swath of territory under consideration, stretching from Galicia across Asturias, Castile and León to Navarre. Davies thus avoids the localism that at times bedevils studies of Iberian diploma (although one cannot help but wish that she had also turned her penetrating eye at least intermittently on Catalonia for comparative purposes). Patterns of exploitation across this territory were in some respects similar, but Davies acknowledges important regional differences: more references to water rights in Castile, more to fruit trees in Galicia. Signs of demographic growth and intensified cultivation appear from the middle of the century. Davies also surveys the human terrain: kings (the mantle of royal government sits very lightly here), counts, bishops, monks, tenants, free peasants, and, occasionally, slaves. Finally, she surveys the evidence -- just under 2000 records, originals and cartulary copies, from monasteries (such as Celanova and Sahagún) and cathedrals, most notably León and Santiago de Compostela.

In chapter 2, Davies moves from broader contexts to the details of how individuals and groups held property. A case study of how relatives wrangled to secure their rights to a single property over the course of decades introduces key themes. Individuals and families enjoyed proprietary interests in churches and monasteries; bishops, while often influential, were far from exercising systematic control over well-defined dioceses. In this environment, it is usually bootless to try to disentangle lay and ecclesiastical interests. During the tenth century, elite families became less likely to establish their own foundations and more apt to make donations to existing institutions. As larger monasteries absorbed private churches, lay control of churches gradually waned.

The diverse modes by which groups held, shared, and alienated property are the subject of Chapter 3. As elsewhere in Europe, family interest in common property was widespread. Property-holders often reconfigured land into different portions. Davies describes practices on a “continuum of sharing, dividing, pooling, and re-dividing . . .” (page 75). These varied forms of exploitation reflect considerable creativity and make it difficult to draw conclusions about overarching patterns, but property-holders seem to have enjoyed a good deal of freedom when it came to dividing or alienating their fields and vineyards.

In the next chapter, “The Language of Donation,” Davies anatomizes the striking “fertility of expression” found in records often described as formulaic. Some of this apparent variety springs from the range of donors. Royal gifts were, for example, predictably more ornate in their rhetoric than those of modest proprietors. Some of this language is gendered;
female donors were often closely associated with expressions of piety. Scribes relied on formularies, but also improvised as circumstances warranted and their abilities allowed. Davies also points to patchy but important evidence of the care that families took in managing their records.

In chapter 5, Davies examines the purposes of donations to churches. In general, piety inspired “acts of giving,” but the precision with which donors articulated their motivations varied. Many donors suggested that they hoped to accrue spiritual benefits such as saintly intercession or monastic prayers. Others stipulated particular services, such as the provision of food or commemoration of family members. Less often, donors made gifts to compensate injured parties. About 14% of the gifts Davies considers went to lay people (the subject of chapter 6), often as compensation for wrongdoing.

In chapter 7, Davies focuses on gender. At all levels of society, men and women acted together as couples. Women enjoyed diverse forms of economic and public power. Records afford abundant evidence of women as donors, witnesses, guarantors, abbesses, and deo votae. With respect to inheritance, alienation, and control of property, women and men seemed to have been on an equal footing or close to it.

In Chapter 8, Davies describes peasant communities that consisted of networks of integrated plots. Individual properties consisted of houses, plots of arable, vineyards, orchards, and shares of rights to use water or mills. Davies points to signs of collection action (often in the context of litigation) and of expressions of collective identity that became increasingly vigorous from the 930s. A final chapter, “Rhetoric and Action,” revisits some of the questions touched on earlier (the growth of monastic partrimonies as part of an incipient process of seigneurialization, the challenge of distinguishing gifts from other forms of exchange) and offers observations on valuations in tenth-century records where, in some cases, a good horse or a few sheep were exchanged for an entire inheritance.

*Acts of Giving* gives us the tenth century on its own terms, not as a jittery prelude to the manifold political and cultural shocks (invasive Cluniacs, feudal violence, Caroline script) that may or may not come around the year 1000. This focus yields a trenchant sense of the lived social, economic, and spiritual realities of property-holders, although some readers might wonder how best to incorporate Davies’s tenth-century donors into a broader chronology of the central Middle Ages.

The evidence that motivates the project at every point has to do with transfers of property, but there is less probing of the distinctive logic of gift-exchange in medieval societies than the volume’s title might suggest. Davies acknowledges the contributions of other scholars, but it is not always clear how she means her work to build upon or complicate this research. Given the general rigor of Davies’ analysis and the amount of extant scholarship focused on gift-exchange in pre-modern Europe, the claim that, “An air of reciprocity hung about these transactions.” (page 114) is disappointingly vague. While to say as much is to hint at a possible shortcoming, it is at the same time to suggest that the book’s title is more modest than it could
be. *Acts of Giving* is less a study narrowly focused on gift-exchange than it is a concise account of tenth-century society in all its complexity. The book’s first chapter, for example, serves not merely to describe evidence of giving but also to introduce the political, social, and economic world of northern Spain. Similarly, chapter 8 not only gives us glimpses of Castilian or Galician peasant groups, but also provides a model for how we might think about the collective action of peasant communities throughout medieval Europe.

In *Acts of Giving*, Davies presents a remarkable picture of the diverse means by which property-holders sought to realize economic and spiritual goals. She keeps broad questions in sight while stressing that land-holding practices and the scribal practices that describe them cannot be forced into procrustean frameworks. She devotes welcome attention to how gender inflected currents of giving. She remains firmly grounded in charter evidence throughout, illustrating broader claims with focused analysis of particular records and noting where our conclusions must remain speculative because of the nature of the evidence. Davies’ careful parsing of records, brisk prose, pellucid account of the quickening pulse of cultivation and exchange, and sensitive description of peasant communities make *Acts of Giving* an impressive contribution to what we know about the tenth century. Hispanists will welcome Davies’ foray into the Iberian peninsula and the book will find a warmly appreciative audience among medievalists more generally.

Jeffrey Bowman, Kenyon College


_Festschriften_ inevitably carry with them tinges of melancholy and regret, and this volume in memory of Richard Fletcher is not without such expressions. When he died, suddenly and too soon, at his Yorkshire home in 2005, Fletcher had earned a reputation as an extraordinary interpreter of the medieval world, at ease in both English and Spanish fields, and at work on what was likely to have become his most ambitious project, a study of the fall of the Roman Empire. As James Campbell, the memoirist of this volume and Fletcher’s former teacher remarks, it is rare for medieval historians to earn “long obituaries in each of the four leading [British] newspapers” (p. 1), and rarer still for such respectful entries to be garnered by one whose work won him selection by the History Book Club. But if he is to be remembered for qualities other than those of his deep and broad research or engaging prose style, they must surely encompass the generosity of his hospitality and his welcome to other scholars. Time and again such humane qualities are remembered by contributors to this volume, and, it should be confessed, by this reviewer who encountered him as both teacher and expansive host.

Editors Barton and Linehan observe that the seventeen papers of the volume touch on three major areas of Fletcher’s scholarship – the medieval Spanish Church and society, interfaith relations, and the post-Roman world – but there are a few outriders in the pack who defy easy
categorization in ways that would have pleased the honoree. Chief amongst these are the essays by Ann Christys and Peter Biller, both of which urge the intense but imaginative examination of sources, especially literary ones, that Fletcher’s work exemplified. The former’s work, “Picnic at Madinat al-Zahra’,” investigates the power of memory and the seduction of nostalgia, evident in sources ranging from eleventh-century poetry to modern writers intent on preserving the mythic imagery of Al-Andalus. Biller’s work is less about the foodstuffs abundantly mentioned in Inquisition records of Albigensian support systems, and more about the silences in those and all records, silences and absences which ought to command more historians’ attention. Roger Wright’s study of “Placenames in Early Medieval Documents: The Case of Cabra” leads readers lucidly through problems of pronunciation and phonetic stress as a pre-Roman town over the centuries witnessed the mangling of its name, which may or may not have anything to do with goats. Wright is only half-joking in his references to the wisdom of giving credence to popular etymology, for like Christys and Biller he also advocates a degree of flexibility when it comes to source analysis. Christopher Tynerman’s contribution can be included in this group as well, as his close reading of First Crusade accounts and their language finds evidence of “assembly politics,” not in any sense that of a proto-democracy, but “communal, dependent on consent, often formally achieved, as much as on command or shared conviction...” (p. 129). He tracks subtle indications that crusade leaders embraced communal participation and consultation, influenced more than they or modern historians have realized by the actions of the urban and village governments they left at home.

The post-Roman world and problems of conversion are treated in the collection first by Roger Collins and Judith McClure’s study of the sources on Augustine’s mission to England. Their close examination of Gregory the Great’s letter collections reveals valuable insights into Frankish politics, papal diplomatic practices, and the remnants of Roman Christianity in Britain, while vindicating Augustine and his companions of charges of cold feet the nearer they got to the back of beyond. Edward James follows with a study of another Gregory, “Gregory of Tours, the Visigoths, and Spain,” tracing the bishop’s studied hostility to Iberia deliberately limned as a hotbed of heresy in order to cast Clovis more convincingly as the orthodox conqueror. James climbs into the more tangled branches of the Merovingian family tree before he is finished, but raises interesting issues concerning Gregory’s sources and the nature of diplomatic marriage in the sixth century. The final essay in the collection, Ian Wood’s “The Fall of the Roman Empire in the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Centuries,” reminds readers of Fletcher’s last and unfinished work, while examining other writers of Gibbon’s period who pondered the end of the ancient world and its relation to their own.

Christian-Muslim relations are illuminated first by Simon Barton’s study of twelfth-century Leonese historical writing, particularly the Chronica Adefonsi Imperatoris. Focusing on the exploits of Alfonso VII down to the conquest of Almeria in 1147, the chronicle did not stint on criticism of Muslims as a people. Nevertheless, the author provided accurate depictions of the Islamic world, taking interest in Iberian and North African geography and political organization, showing “as Richard Fletcher understood better than anybody, ... that religious ideology was but one among any number of competing political, social, economic and cultural forces which conditioned and drove human actions” (p. 174). Likewise, Ian Michael reminds us of the
multicultural perspective of the Libro de buen amor, deeply imbued with the speech, habits, and perspectives of the Toledo population and judged “the greatest literary product of the city of three faiths” (p. 292). The essay’s review of Mozarabic culture, both intellectual and common, may not be groundbreaking, but it serves to underline the need to understand the philosophical debates current in the city and underpinning the Libro in ways still under-appreciated. Esther Pascua, on the other hand, attempts to cast a traditional topic, transhumance and Mesta politics, into a new mold influenced by recent interest in environmental history. She makes good use of the abundant documents of the Casa de Ganaderos of Zaragoza, rejecting easy dichotomies between northern Christian pastoralists and southern Muslim farmers. But while valuable in its observations of how much can be learned about the landscape and its reactions to population growth, the “much more complex reality … of interaction between several communities” (pp. 309, 310) Pascua insists upon discerning seems little more than a matter of shading. Her footnotes contain the more recent contributions to the debate, but one would have liked to have seen her engage the work of Julian Bishko, an environmental historian before his time.

The topic ‘Church and society in medieval Spain’ unsurprisingly attracts the most contributors, profitably mining increasingly available sources and urging closer readings of neglected works. Bernard Reilly leads us through “The Rediscovery of Count Pedro Ansúrez,” with a few stops in the traditional chronicles of Lucas of Túy and Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada. But Reilly really wants to explore the challenge of medieval prosopography in the wake of “the veritable avalanche of printed collections of medieval documents…that began in the mid-sixties and continues still” (p. 114), particularly the 464 documents in which Count Pedro figures. What emerges is a complex portrait of a contemporary and companion of Alfonso VI, courtier and frontiersman, linked by patronage to bishoprics, monasteries and a collegiate church, heading a comital household mirroring in its modest way the administrative organization of the king’s. With greater brevity, John Williams examines “The Tomb of St. James: The View from the Other Side,” tracking through excavations and written documentation the planned disappearance of the monastery originally created to house the monks preserving the cult of St. James. Architectural design may have been directed by the victors in this case, but Williams’s rescue of San Salvador de Antealtares from obscurity prevents them from dominating all the history, too. Likewise, James D’Emilio sheds light on “The Cathedral Chapter of Lugo in the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries,” enjoying along with Reilly the increased availability of documents that should encourage many in the years to come to build on what Fletcher started. In Lugo’s case, they reveal the consequences of waves of reform, finding their most salient expression in the institution of anniversaries, whose endowment provided a steady source of income and a devoted lay commitment, especially by women, to the cathedral community. Thornier relations between local communities, the diocese of Zamora, and the mid-thirteenth-century papacy find voice in Peter Linehan’s study of D. Gil Torres. Zamora may unfairly ignore its native son today, but by his death in 1254 Cardinal Gil had won a vital place at the papal curia. Linehan questions his traditional reputation as a nepotistic arranger of papal provisions to local benefices, most notably by reference to comments made by Grosseteste and Matthew Paris at the time. Lucas de Tuy’s De altera uita gains a close reading from Emma Falque, its anti-heretical stance supported by ample influence from the works of Augustine, Gregory the Great, and Isidore of

AARHMS Spring 2009| 21
Seville. Lucas himself may have taken part in the Albigensian case inspiring the tract; certainly his connection to the monastic community of Leon gave him ample reason to include Isidore in his treatise. In his tribute to Fletcher’s commitment to inter-faith dialogue, John Edwards elegantly connects current participants in Jewish-Christian debate with the works of two fifteenth-century Castilian authors in “New Light on the Converso Debate? The Jewish Christianity of Alfonso [sic] de Cartagena and Juan de Torquemada.” These two conversos condemned the anti-Jewish actions of their own day, Alonso stressing the apostolic mission rather than the crucifixion as the central point of redemption, and Juan identifying the very flesh and blood of the Eucharist as Jewish and thus central to all Christians. But their words fell on deaf ears then, and continue to do so now, with presentist interpretations dominating, and Judaism and Christianity continuing to be seen as “separate and mutually exclusive systems of beliefs and practice” (p. 326).

These brief summaries fail to do justice to the variety, scholarship, and good humor present throughout this collection. It is a work of high quality, both in content and presentation, assembled with the respect and admiration felt by all who knew the honoree. Coming too soon in the life and career of its remarkable subject, the work combines within its pages what Campbell’s opening memoir identifies as Fletcher’s own unique synthesis of “a sometimes ironic sense of the past with a thoughtfulness edging on melancholy” (p. 15).

Lorraine Attreed, College of the Holy Cross


Published in 2007, La mujer en la baja edad media: Aproximación a su estudio joins Ángel Luis Molina Molina’s cadre of texts on the Spanish medieval period. Though he is perhaps most known for his work on the region of Murcia, in this project, Molina seeks to characterize the experiences of women throughout the late medieval period. As the title suggests, this text is a brief review of women’s experiences meant to be a point of departure rather than a comprehensive review of medieval women’s history and is aimed at students or those unfamiliar with the field.

In the introduction, Molina recognizes that history has long focused on the history of men by silencing the voices of women and ambitiously situates his text as one which will overcome that silence. Aware of the temptation to study history solely as a means to understand the present, Molina seeks to understand the experiences of women during the late medieval period as men and women of the time might have understood them. He roots his historical analysis in contemporary notions, laws, and practices, which he claims were largely articulated by two main groups, the clergy and the aristocracy. Molina sees the major issue surrounding the consideration of women of this time to be the conflict between Evangelical texts, which call for the equality of men and women before God, and Eastern tradition, which insists on the
inferiority of women in patriarchal society (14). In each of the nine chapters which follow, Molina focuses on a specific role which women played during the period and aims to understand that role through texts which theorize it, laws which delineate it, and evidence of common practices which are often at odds with both law and theory. The nine chapters focus on social issues relating to women: fears about women, the education of women, marriage, adultery, work, religious life, concubinage, prostitution, and domestic violence.

Perhaps the most successful chapter is chapter nine in which Molina carefully considers the role of the prostitute, which given his 1998 text *Mujeres públicas, mujeres secretas (la prostitución y su mundo, siglos XIII – XVII)* is not surprising. His project is particularly well articulated and executed in this chapter. He begins by outlining the Church’s views on prostitution as explained by St. Thomas Aquinas and St. Augustine, both of whom condemned prostitution, but saw it as a necessary evil meant to control lustful passions. He goes on to note the massive legal shift with respect to prostitution which took place during the late medieval period. While prostitution was initially conceived as a means to protect the reputations of good women and provide men a harmless way of serving their carnal needs, by the fifteenth century prostitution had become an institution of public service necessary for maintaining public order (101). Molina concludes the chapter by discussing the experiences of women who took on the role of prostitute, noting their increased objection to institutional regulation, their relationships with men and women meant to secure clients, and the continuing precariousness of practicing a profession which was neither private nor public. The chapter not only provides a plethora of details, footnotes, and evidence of specific cases, but effectively employs the approach Molina lays out in the introduction, providing readers a glimpse at the ideological, legal, and practical issues surrounding prostitution in late medieval Castile.

Not all of the chapters in the text are as effective as the one which treats prostitution. Chapter 3, “La educación femenina,” struggles with the structure Molina assigned himself in the introduction; the result is a chapter which presents an uneven approach to the topic and veers away from the Iberian Peninsula, resulting in a review of women’s education which is neither Hispanist nor European. Though he begins the chapter well, looking at the clear link between women’s education and preparation for marriage, Molina finishes the chapter with a brief look at Luis Vives’s *Institutio foeminae christianae* (1523), a long list of medieval women who were educated throughout the rest of Europe (resembling a list of illustrious women from the *querelle des femmes*), a mention of Christine de Pizan’s *Book of the City of Ladies*, and a suggestion that the education of queens and princesses followed a different set of standards. While studies of women’s education in medieval Iberia are not overabundant, there is certainly much more information available than Molina’s readers might surmise based on this chapter. The silence surrounding the boom in classical and humanistic education for women during the reign of Isabel the Catholic is certainly surprising, especially since Fray Martín de Córdoba’s *Jardín de las nobles doncellas* is mentioned, albeit in a footnote. I found Molina’s lack of Spanish or Iberian examples of educated women troubling, as it insinuated that we have little to no evidence of learned peninsular women, a supposition which is clearly not true. While I admire Molina’s attempt to situate Spanish or Iberian women’s experiences within a European context, his inclusion of Christine de Pizan seems anachronistic as there is currently no evidence
that her now canonical text was even known to late medieval or Early Modern readers in Spain. Perhaps using Teresa de Cartagena’s *Admiración operum Dey* as an example of a female-authored text which supported the education of women might have been more effective.

In short, Ángel Luis Molina Molina’s *La mujer en la baja edad media* is a text which raises some important points and can serve as a springboard for those just starting to explore the field. While the footnotes do contain a number of helpful references, the addition of suggestions for further reading or a bibliography would certainly be helpful. Nonetheless, the text contributes to the expanding selection of texts aimed at the Pre- and Early Modern Spanish women’s history and reminds us that there is still much work to be done in this field.

Ann Craig Befroy, PhD Candidate and Lane Cooper Fellow, NYU


Nuria Silleras-Fernández has already published several excellent articles on the subject of queenship in late medieval Aragon and the career of María de Luna. Here the bulk of her impressive research on the venerable Queen of Aragon has been synthesized into one comprehensive volume which attempts to analyze the whole of María de Luna’s political life, from her beginnings as an important heiress to her challenging reign at the turn of the fifteenth century. Drawing on the ‘abundance of material’ (8) which has been preserved from María de Luna’s career in the Archives of the Crown of Aragon (*Arxiu de la Corona d’Aragó*) as well as several regional and municipal archives, Silleras-Fernández builds up a comprehensive study of the life and work of María de Luna which is securely placed the wider context of medieval queenship and the socio-political movements of the late medieval era. The author also discusses the unique position of Aragonese queen-lieutenants and of María de Luna herself, as a woman who was a significant Aragonese ‘lord’ in her own right in contrast to other foreign princesses who served as queen consorts, such as her controversial predecessor, Violante of Bar.

The book begins in chronological fashion, examining María’s importance as the heiress of Count Lope de Luna and her early formative years in the court of Elíonor de Sicilia as the bride of Martí, the younger son of the King of Aragon. A series of maps highlights the impressive territories held by the young couple, which were comprised of her own substantial patrimony, María’s dower lands and territory donated by the king to his younger son. While undoubtedly useful, these maps would have benefited from the addition of shading and/or color to highlight the territory in question, as the use of boxes and fonts to denote the areas is somewhat awkward and confusing. However, this does not detract from the overall evaluation of María’s years of experience as an active and capable administrator of the lands held by the young couple and her crucial role in generating the necessary financial support for her husband’s Sicilian campaign. The second chapter is a thorough examination of María’s exceptional handling of the difficult year between May 1396-May 1397 when María was forced to confront
the succession crisis following the death of her brother-in-law Joan I. María was able to not only claim and hold the throne for her husband in his absence, but defuse the potential threat of her predecessor’s possible pregnancy and defend the realm from invasion by the forces of a rival claimant, Joana de Foix.

Silleras-Fernández then decides to step back from the previous chronological trajectory to focus on family ties in the third chapter, discussing María’s influence as the mother of Martí the Younger and the matriarch of the Luna clan. The fourth chapter picks up on María’s political career in 1397 and examines her role as an effectively equal partner in her husband’s reign. Silleras-Fernández attributes the relative equality in their relationship to several main factors: first, their shared upbringing in the court of Martí’s mother which she feels created a sibling-like relationship with a sense of mutual trust and understanding. Secondly, the author points out the lack of rivals, both in male blood relations and of mistresses which helped to solidify María’s position as Martí’s right hand. Silleras-Fernández draws on a wealth of solid documentary evidence including María’s personal and political correspondence as well as administrative records to demonstrate her fully active role in governing her own possessions, the Kingdom of Valencia and her involvement and influence over the whole of the Aragonese possessions, including her son’s kingdom of Sicily.

Chapter five discusses María’s role as a pious patron, and her use of religion to further her own political goals including her use of the family connection to the ‘Papa Luna’ Avignonese Pope (Benedict XIII). María was closely involved in the ecclesiastical communities of her kingdom, giving alms, participating in public religious ceremonies and acting as a patron of major projects such as the Convent of Sancti Spiritus and of the Franciscan Order. The chapter also includes an interesting schematic representation of ‘The Cycle of Patronage’ which attempts to illustrate the connection between the royal couple and the Franciscans to further their own agendas.

The following chapter discusses the role of the queen’s court and royal ceremony to strengthen her position. The household of the queen is discussed at length, delving into great detail regarding the roles of various members from the majordomo to the lowly sobreatzembler or muleteer who was responsible for the queen’s beasts of burden. The author also examines María’s role as benefactress, providing dowries for her ladies in waiting and keeping the female members of her own family comfortably clothed and employed as key members of her retinue. Finally, the importance of maintaining ‘queenly dignity’ through the use of ritual, ceremony and display including the coronation of the Queen and Royal Entrées is demonstrated through the evidence of expenditures and contemporary accounts which build up a picture of these politically charged events.

Finally, the author sums up with an effective conclusion which analyzes the successes and failures of the Queen’s career and her place in the wider context of Aragonese and Iberian queenship. Silleras-Fernández discusses the development of the role of Queen-lieutenant, and how it paved the way in part for later women to be involved in the governance of the Spanish Empire, such as Isabel of Portugal, Margaret of Austria and Margaret of Parma. Throughout the book, she repeatedly stresses that María’s success as a female ruler derived from her careful
positioning as her husband’s helpmeet and second stating that “María became an expert at wielding her power without publicly undermining her husband or offending contemporary sensibilities regarding the place of a woman”(113).

Altogether, this is a well crafted and thoroughly researched account of the political career of a truly remarkable woman. The author’s clear and highly readable style makes this an enjoyable as well as informing read which would be of great use to any scholar of Iberian history or medieval queenship but would not be beyond the reach of an interested layperson. There are only two critical comments that I can offer; first, that the author lays perhaps too much of the blame for the failure of the dynasty at the María’s door. She rightly notes that a queen’s primary role was to provide an heir for the kingdom; while María was not as prolific as her near contemporary Philippa of Hainault for example, she did produce four children. The fact that only one of her progeny lived to adulthood and ultimately died without leaving behind a legitimate heir cannot be held as a criticism of María per se, rather perhaps an all too frequent example of infant mortality in the late medieval era. The other point to mention is that the flow of the book would be greatly improved by reversing the order of the third and fourth chapter. As historians, it is always difficult to make the decision between working thematically or chronologically, but to shift between modes is confusing and unnecessary. By placing the otherwise excellent chapter on family later in the book, the chronological investigation could reach its natural conclusion before the thematic section was introduced. Overall, however this is an excellent work on a fascinating female sovereign which would be a superb addition to any academic’s or library’s bookshelf.

Elena Woodacre
Bath Spa University

All reviews are available on-line at the AARHMS site. Books for review and offers to review books may be sent to the book review editor, Simon Doubleday at the Department of History, Hofstra University (Simon.R.Doubleday@hofstra.edu).
Conference Announcements

Call for Papers:
37th Sewanee Medieval Colloquium April 9-10, 2010
on the theme of Pilgrimage in the Middle Ages

Plenary speakers: David Gitlitz and Linda Davidson

We invite 20-minute papers from all disciplines on any aspect of medieval pilgrimage. We also welcome proposals for 3-paper sessions on particular topics related the theme. Please submit an abstract (approx. 250 words) and brief c.v., electronically if possible, no later than 1 October 2009. If you wish to propose a session, please submit abstracts and vitae for all participants in the session. Commentary is traditionally provided for each paper presented; completed papers, including notes, will be due no later than 10 March 2010. The Sewanee Medieval Colloquium Prize will be awarded for the best paper by a graduate student or recent PhD recipient (degree awarded since July 2007). For further information on the Sewanee Medieval Colloquium, see http://www.sewanee.edu/Medieval/main.html.

Please address submissions and inquiries to Stephen B. Raulston, sraulsto@sewanee.edu.

ALFONSO VI EN NUEVA YORK
IX CENTENARIO DE LA MUERTE (1109-2009)
Encuentro de estudiosos
New York University. Centro Rey Juan Carlos I de España
24 de abril de 2009

Programa

Sesión de la mañana: de 9:00-12:00

Presentación: H. Salvador Martínez, New York University

Bienvenida a los participantes: Prof. Edward Sullivan, Dean of Humanities, New York University

El rey y su reino

Moderadora: Georgina Dopico-Black, New York University

Preludio: “El último día de Alfonso VI, 1 de julio de 1109” (H. Salvador Martínez)
1. Bernard F. Reilly, Prof. Emeritus, Villanova University:  
   “Alfonso VI of León-Castile (1065-1109) and His Bishops”  
2. Patrick Henriet, Universidad de Burdeos, Francia:  
   “La España monástica de Alfonso VI”  
3. Francisco Hernández, Carleton University, Canadá:  
   “La bolición del rito hispánico y su impacto cultural”  
4. Georges Martin, Universidad París-La Sorbonne, Francia:  
   “Mujeres hilando un reinado. Alfonso VI en la rueca”


Sesión de la tarde: 2:30-5:30

Mecenazgo artístico y cultural: el Monasterio de Sahagún

Moderadora: Jerrilynn D. Dodds, City College of the CUNY

1. Emmanuelle Klinka, Universidad de Niza, Francia:  
   “La realizaciones artísticas del reinado de Alfonso VI”  
2. Exposición conjunta:  
   Javier Pérez Gil, Universidad de Valladolid, España;  
   Eduardo González Fraile, Universidad de Valladolid, España; y  
   Javier Rivera Blanco, Universidad de Alcalá de Henares, España:  
   “El monasterio de Sahagún, sede y panteón de Alfonso VI: claves para su estudio y Restauración”.

Pausa y Refresco  

Mesa redonda: 6:00-7:00

Moderadora: María Rosa Menocal, Yale University

Patrocinadores:

El Encuentro has sido patrocinado por: The Humanities Initiative (NYU), El Ministerio de Cultura de España; El Grupo Europeo de Investigación SIREM-AILP (GDRE del CNRS, Francia), el Decano de Humanidades (NYU), el Medieval and Renaissance Center (NYU), el Departamento de Español y Portugués (NYU), La Caixa, el Consulado General de España en Nueva York; y el Centro Rey Juan Carlos I de España (NYU)
**Members’ Announcements**

Dr. Weston Cook announces he receive the University of North Carolina's 2009 Award for Excellence in Teaching.

*Congratulations!!!!!!*

~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~

Mark D. Johnston announces:


*Congratulations!!!!!!*

~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~

Eleanor Congdon announces:

She will be on sabbatical 2009-2010, working on her book on Venetians in the Western Mediterranean around 1400, her next big project on Venetian merchant networks in Syria and the Aegean around 1480, and finishing off long overdue articles, etc.

She has also been chosen to participate in the Newberry Library's biennial Italian Vernacular Paleography seminar, sponsored by the Mellon Foundation, and this year held at the Getty Institute.

*Congratulations!!!!!!*

~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~

Robert Hughes announces:


He is also working on translations of:
VICENT FERRER, DE UNITATE UNIVERSALIS, *Text llatí i versió medieval hebraea amb traducció catalana i anglesa (The Latin text and its Hebrew medieval version with Catalan and English translations)*, ALEXANDER FIDORA & MAURO ZONTA (EDS.) (from Catalan into English)

Albert Hauf’s edition of the *Vita Christi* by Isabel de Villena (again into English).


*Congratulations!!!!!*

~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~

Connie Scarborough announces:

*A Holy Alliance: Alfonso X's Poltical Use of Marian Poetry*. Available from Juan de la Cuesta Press at [www.juadelacuesta.com](http://www.juadelacuesta.com)

*Congratulations!!!!!*

~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~

William D. Phillips, Jr. announces:

Adjunct professor of history, University of Texas, Austin, 2008---.

Director, Center for Early Modern History, University of Minnesota, 2001-08.


Invited Research Scholar, Institute for Historical Research, University of Texas, Austin, 2008-09.

Board of Directors, Associates of the James Ford Bell Library, 2007---.

Corresponding member, Real Academia de la Historia (Spanish Royal Academy of History), Madrid, 2005---.

Society for Spanish and Portuguese Historical Studies, Bishko Prize Committee chair, 2008-09.

PUBLICATIONS


PRESENTATIONS


“La historia de la esclavitud y la historia medieval de la Península Ibérica,” inaugural address in the international symposium “Minas y esclavos en la Península Ibérica y el Maghreb en la edad media,” Calatayud, Spain, June 18, 2008.

Congratulations!!!!!

~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~

Charles Carrillo announces:

“On a whim we visited the Yaqui "Pascal" ceremony in Tucson over Easter. Incredible syncretism combining the 17th century survival of the Catholic diocese against hostile factions and the Resurrection story. Christ's body is brought back from the cross while locals do their traditional Easter rituals in the church. Ominous pagan factions dance in masks and native costumes alongside the Judean Fariseos in black shrouds outside the sanctuary. It all culminates in a violent rush on the church by about 200 evil ones while spectators throw bushels of confetti at them. The faithful emerge from the sanctuary and bombard the attackers with flowers -again represented by confetti- and the attack is repulsed. Then the Fariseos and pagans toss their costumes and weapons into a bonfire, cross themselves and become
exculpated through the penance of the ceremony. What a fantastic experience! One I never knew of before.”

*What a great experience!!!!!*

~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~

Brian Catlos announces:
He has been appointed Book Review Editor, Late Middle Ages of *Speculum*

Publication:

*Congratulations!!!!!*

~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~

Therese Martin announces:
She will be leaving the University of Arizona at the end of the semester for a position at the Instituto de Historia of the Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas in Madrid.

Publications:
'Una reconstrucción hipotética de la portada norte de la Real Colegiata de San Isidoro, León,' *Archivo Español de Arte* 81, no. 324 (2008), 357-378.

'Recasting the Concept of the 'Pilgrimage Church': The Case of San Isidoro de León,' *La Corónica, A Journal of Medieval Spanish Language, Literature & Cultural Studies* 36/2 (2008), 165-189.


*Congratulations!!!!!*

~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~

Núria Silleras-Fernandez announces:

In August 2009, she will take up the position of Assistant Professor at the Department of Spanish and Portuguese at the University of Colorado at Boulder.

*Congratulations!!!!!*
This newsletter is sent out only in electronic format. The AARHMS email distribution list will not be made public, sold or otherwise used except for the distribution of the semi-annual AARHMS newsletter.

Please email address corrections to Dana Lightfoot, newsletter editor at: djlightfoot@utep.edu

©2008 American Association of Research Historians of Medieval Spain, an affiliated society of the American Historical Association.